



City of
Peterborough

TO: Members of the Budget Committee

FROM: W. H. Jackson, Director of Utility Services

MEETING DATE: November 26, 2012

SUBJECT: Report USDIR12-019
Public Transit Operations Review – 2013 Budget Implications

PURPOSE

To recommend the first changes to the operation of public transit stemming from the Public Transit Operations Review which have 2013 Operating and Capital budget implications.

RECOMMENDATIONS

That Council approve the recommendations outlined in Report USDIR12-019 dated November 26, 2012, of the Director of Utility Services, as follows:

- a) That the 2013 Public Transit Operating and Capital Budgets be amended as described in the following recommendations;
- b) That effective January 2, 2013 a general public transit fare increase of approximately 10% for all fare media in all fare categories with cash fares increased from \$2.25 to \$2.50 be implemented and that the User Fee Listing be amended to reflect this change;
- c) That effective January 2, 2013 timed transfers between routes on the conventional public transit system be increased from the current 60 minutes to 90 minutes;

-
- d) That effective May 5, 2013 the conventional public transit route changes illustrated in the Public Transit Operations Review and as described in this report be implemented;
 - e) That effective May 5, 2013 the conventional public transit service delivery be amended such that appropriate routes be interlined (paired) through the Simcoe Street Transit Terminal;
 - f) That effective May 5, 2013 Route 12 be amended to a morning and evening peak period service only;
 - g) That effective May 5, 2013 the first morning trip be eliminated on all Saturday routes;
 - h) That effective May 5, 2013 weekday morning and afternoon peak period level of service be increased from 40 minute frequency to 20 minute frequency on Routes 2, 7, 8 and 10;
 - i) That effective May 5, 2013 the North Community Bus Route be implemented;
 - j) That a one-time increase of \$28,000 be approved in the 2013 Bus Stop and Shelter maintenance operating budget to change existing transit stops to support the recommended revised route structure;
 - k) That effective January 2, 2013 the complement of Dispatch/Scheduler Supervisors be amended converting 2 part-time positions to full-time with the number of part-time positions reduced from the existing 7 to 5;
 - l) That effective March 1, 2013 a new full-time Transit Operations Supervisor-Projects Co-ordinator position be created;
 - m) That Capital Budget Item 5-11.02 “Transit Buses” be adjusted to reflect the purchase of 2 additional forty foot low-entry fully accessible transit buses bringing the total purchase to 6 buses funds for which will come from the Transit Capital Reserve;
 - n) That Capital Budget Item 5-11.02 “Transit Buses” be adjusted to reflect the purchase of one small low-floor fully accessible transit bus to initiate the North Community Bus service funds for which will come from the Transit Capital Reserve; and
 - o) That the approved 2012 Capital Budget (Item 5-11.03 “Buses for Persons with Disabilities”) for the purchase of 2 low-floor purpose built buses for the Handi-Van service be altered to purchase 6 high-floor lift-equipped vans as immediate replacement vehicles for existing aged Handi-Van buses with no additional funding.

BUDGET AND FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

Fourteen recommendations in this report affect the 2013 Operating and Capital budgets. The related recommendations have been grouped to reflect implementation and are summarized as follows:

1. General Fare Increase (Recommendations b and c): A general fare increase implemented January 2, 2013 is projected to generate \$365,000 in added farebox revenue for conventional transit and \$7,400 for specialized transit (Handi-Van and Community Bus Route 1). The increase in transfer times will cost an estimated \$31,600 in lost revenue and is included in the increased fare generation numbers.
2. Route and Level of Service Changes (Recommendations d, e, f, g and h): Restructuring the conventional public transit routes by altering where they travel combined with level of service alterations and increased 20 minute peak frequency of service on four routes implemented in May results in added part year operating costs of \$165,000.
3. Community Bus and Handi-Van Service (Recommendation i): The May implementation of the first Community Bus route combined with shifting resources from Handi-Van door to door service delivery results in an overall productivity enhancement, reduced service hours and a part year cost reduction of \$28,600.
4. Transit Stop/Shelter Maintenance (Recommendation j): The route revisions incorporated in the plan will necessitate the relocation of a number of bus stops and some transit shelters. It is estimated that a one time increase of \$28,000 in stop/shelter maintenance costs will be incurred to implement the route restructuring.
5. Staff Dispatch/Scheduler Supervisors (Recommendation k): Converting 2 part-time positions to full-time will have a salary plus benefit cost of \$69,425.
6. Transit Operations Supervisor- Project Co-ordinator Position (Recommendation l): Adding a staff person to deliver the recommendations of the Plan has a part year salary plus benefits cost of \$71,790 with a March 1, 2013 start date.
7. Purchase of 2 forty foot transit buses (Recommendation m): To add two fully accessible low-entry forty foot transit buses requires an additional \$961,200 in the Capital Budget to be funded from the Transit Capital Reserve.
8. Purchase of 1 small low-floor fully accessible bus for Community Bus (Recommendation n): Expanding the transit fleet by one specialized bus to deliver the first of the Community Bus routes requires an additional capital budget of \$285,000 to be funded from Transit Capital Reserve.

9. Purchase of six high-floor lift equipped replacement vans for Handi-Van (Recommendation o): The existing approved Capital budget has \$566,500 for purchase of two low-floor buses. Shifting to less expensive high-floor lift equipped vans permits this purchase without adding to the 2013 budget.

Table 1 entitled “2013 Budget Implications of Proposed Transit Changes as per Report USDIR12-019” summarizes the budget and financial implications associated with the recommendations. The impact of the recommendations as proposed in this report will result in an estimated saving of almost \$67,000 in the 2013 Transit Operating Budget.

At this time it is suggested that no reduction in the 2013 budget be made to reflect this saving because of the number, and magnitude, of assumptions that had to be made to cost the various proposals such as:

- Uptake in the increased transfer time;
- Ridership levels given the proposed fare increase;
- The ability to make all route and level of service changes as proposed and at the cost estimated by the Consultant;
- The purchase price of the new vehicles required to provide the service upgrades; and
- The level of effort needed to meet the timelines proposed in this report.

Implementation of the recommended Capital Budget amendments in this report plus the other proposed 2013 Transit Capital Budget items will deplete the Transit Capital Reserve.

Table 1: 2013 Budget Implications of Proposed Transit Changes as per Report USDIR12-019

Recommendation	Annualized Cost/Revenue Impact to Operating Budget	2013 Cost/Revenue Impact		Impact of Delayed Fare Increase to May 2013	Recommended Net Budget Change (2013)	
		Operating	Capital		Operating	Capital
General Fare Increase	(\$372,400)	(\$372,400)		(\$248,300)	(\$372,400)	
Route and Level of Service Changes	\$247,600	\$165,000		\$165,000	\$165,000	
Community Bus and Handi-Van Service	(\$42,900)	(\$28,600)		(28,600)	(\$28,600)	
Transit Stop/Shelter Maintenance	—	\$28,000 (one time)		\$28,000	\$28,000	
Staff Dispatch/Scheduler Supervisors	\$69,425	\$69,425		\$69,425	\$69,425	
Staff Addition Transit Operations Supervisor- Project Co-ordinator	\$86,150	\$71,790		\$71,790	\$71,790	
Purchase of 2 forty foot transit buses			\$961,200			\$961,200
Purchase of 1 small low-floor fully accessible bus for Community Bus			\$285,000			\$285,000
Purchase of six high-floor lift equipped replacement vans for Handi-Van			\$566,500			-
SUB-TOTAL	(\$12,125)	(\$66,785)	\$1,812,700	\$57,315	(\$66,785)	\$1,246,200
Budget Contingency		\$66,785			\$66,785	
TOTAL	(\$12,125)	0	\$1,812,700	\$57,315	0	\$1,246,200

Notes:

- 1) The budget projections illustrated for the fare increase and transit operational changes are drawn from the Public Transit Operations Review Report as prepared by Dillon Consulting. Projections for Staff costs prepared by City Staff.
- 2) Capital costs for bus purchases to be funded through Transit Capital Reserve. Handi-Van purchase is existing budget approved in 2012.

BACKGROUND

Council, at its meeting of November 13, 2012 approved the November 5, 2012 Report USDIR12-016, "Peterborough Public Transit Operations Review-Final Report and Implementation Plan" (Appendix A minus the Consultant's final report).

The Public Transit Operations Review (the "Plan") was initiated in September 2011 and concluded with the adoption of the Final Report in November 2012. The Project undertook a comprehensive review of Peterborough's transit services and developed a service plan covering the period 2012-2017 including assessment and recommendations on Conventional Route Transit, TransCab and Handi-Van services. The Report contains a total of eighty-seven recommendations and action items for all facets of the services delivered.

Based upon the recommendations contained in the Report, Staff prepared a Summary of Recommendations-Implementation Plan Summary to guide the work plan for the Transportation Division/Transit Section recognizing that many of the individual recommendations have an affect on budgets.

The 2013 draft Operating and Capital Budget had already gone to print prior to approval of the Plan and as such, no Plan recommendations were included in the budget. The Plan recommendations which staff are proposing to implement for 2013 and which have 2013 budget implications are summarized in this report and detailed in the following sections.

1. General Public Transit Fare Increase

The following table illustrates the existing and proposed transit fares by category.

Description	Existing 2012 Fare	Proposed 2013 Fare
Cash all categories	\$2.25	\$2.50
Family Day Pass	\$7.00	\$8.00
All categories 10 Ride pass	\$20.00	\$22.00
Student 30 day pass	\$50.00	\$55.00
Senior/Child 30 day pass	\$33.00	\$40.00
Adult 30 day pass	\$55.00	\$60.00
Senior annual/semi-annual	\$200.00/\$120.00	\$220.00/\$135.00
College Semester	\$200.00	\$220.00

The Plan recommended that the Senior Annual and Semi-Annual transit passes ultimately be eliminated. It is also recommended that the City develop a Transit Affordability Program which would offer affordable fares for all fare categories based upon income thresholds for single and multi-person households. It was intended that this strategy would incorporate and eliminate the need for the Senior Annual/Semi-annual pass.

Developing a Transit Affordability Program and making final recommendations on Senior semi-annual and annual passes will require additional study and analysis and as such it is proposed that the existing fare categories should remain until the Affordability Program can be implemented. In the interim, the annual and semi-annual passes for Seniors are proposed to increase at the same general rate as all fares.

The Plan recommended that the general fare increase be implemented at the same time as the route and service changes. To effect the various service changes will require detailed analysis of the various impacted routes and the purchase of additional buses. Accordingly, these changes cannot be implemented immediately and are proposed to be implemented in the spring of 2013. The fare increases, however, are proposed to increase at the first of the year to better offset the additional costs of the service enhancements. The last fare increase was in 2009 so the minimal increases proposed for 2013 are not believed to be out of line. Nevertheless, if Council wishes the fare increases to be effective coincident with the onset of service enhancements, the estimated additional fares collected would shrink from \$372,400 to \$248,300 resulting in a 2013 budget shortfall of \$57,315. Implementing the fare increase January 1, 2013 will provide a 2013 Budget contingency of \$66,785 (see Table 1).

At this time, however, it is suggested that no reduction in the 2013 budget be made to reflect these savings because of the number of assumptions that had to be made to cost the various proposals such as:

- Uptake in the increased transfer time;
- Ridership levels given the proposed fare increase;
- The ability to make all route and level of service changes as proposed and costed by the Consultant;
- The purchase price of the new vehicles required to provide the service upgrades; and
- The ability to meet the timelines proposed in this report.

The concern is that \$66,785 is relatively small considering the magnitude of the assumptions made to arrive at this figure and the potential for error in any number of areas.

As an alternative, and if Council were willing to take the risk of requiring additional 2013 budget if the estimates are incorrect, the fare increase could be implemented on March 1, 2013. This is approximately the break even point where the additional revenues from the increased fares will match the additional costs of the level of service and route changes suggested for 2013.

The Plan recommended that the valid time interval for a transfer between buses on conventional transit be increased from 60 minute to 90 minutes. The transit system issues 170,000 transfers. It is projected that the extended time will permit an added 20,000 trips to be completed as transfers versus new fares thereby reducing annualized fare revenue by \$31,600. This fare reduction has been incorporated into the overall fare revenue calculation.

2. Route and Level of Service Changes

The Plan groups a number of route and level of service changes together for delivery in the first year of the five-year Plan. It is anticipated that these changes can be implemented commencing in the spring of 2013 following the completion of the post-secondary school year. Prior to implementation, the revisions require design, operational testing, staffing and marketing/public information. The services proposed to be included in the initial changes are:

- Introduction of new route structure and 20 minute peak service on Routes 2B, 7, 8 and 10;
- Elimination of first run on all routes in the early morning on Saturdays;
- Modification of the Trent East Bank Express service in combination with Route 9 as a service integration;
- Reclassification of Route 12 (Major Bennett) from full service route to peak period Monday to Saturday only; and
- Interline (pairing) of transit routes through the transit terminal to reduce forced transfers between buses for passengers with trips that continue between high transit demand origins/destinations.

3. Community Bus Implementation:

The Plan recommends the introduction of a Community Bus service in addition to Handi-Van services and the accessible base route system. The Community Bus would be designed to serve as a route primarily oriented to serving seniors and people with a mobility related disability but would be open to all potential users. The focus would be senior's apartments, assisted living centers, clinics, shopping and personal service areas and other activity centers.

This service would be closely integrated with the conventional transit services, providing some local transit coverage and the opportunity to transfer between Community Bus and conventional routes at the downtown terminal. The final design of the Community Bus service will involve extensive consultation with seniors groups and representatives of senior's residences in Peterborough as well as persons using the current Handi-Van service and transit staff involved with the Handi-Van service. It is suggested that there would be one route on the north side of the City and one route in the central-south area of the City. Additional routes would be considered based on the service achieving specific financial and performance targets.

The design of the community bus services should be coordinated with the conventional transit services to support local transit coverage where required as well as serving seniors and persons with disabilities.

The Plan recommends that initially one route (proposed to be the North Route) be implemented and operated for one year before expanding to a second Community Bus route. To complete the design, operational testing and customer awareness will take some time and as such it is recommended that the first Community Bus route be implemented in May 2013.

4. Transit Stop Shelter Maintenance

To initiate the first year route changes it is forecast that a minimum of 50 of the City's 620 transit stops and 6 of the 67 transit shelters will require relocating. There is a one time estimated cost of \$28,000 associated with this work, which will require additional funds in the 2013 proposed operating maintenance budget.

5. Dispatch/Scheduler Supervisors

Public transit services are operated in excess of 125 hours per week. A typical Monday to Saturday has 17.5 hrs of daily service delivery for both conventional and Handi-Van services with 12 hours on Sunday. Ensuring that service is operating for each of these hours is the responsibility of the Dispatch/Scheduler Supervisor. This position dispatches and tracks all transit vehicles, ensures that there is staff to cover all work including relief for sickness, overtime and extra work that changes daily, co-ordinates all bus arrivals and departures from the downtown terminal ensuring safety and maximum efficiency, as well as responding to customer concerns/complaints. During the designated shift the complete operation including staff issues/discipline rests with this position. During evening and weekend hours this is the only Supervisor on-site.

When fully staffed, this role has seven non-union part-time staff each working up to a maximum of 26 hours per week. The number of positions is sufficient for coverage (including vacation relief and illness coverage) but is not effective. Part-time positions that require carryover from shift to shift of matters such as investigation into customer complaints, driver issues, discipline matters, or route operational concerns are inherently ineffective because there is little continuity and these issues are often touched by at least three individuals leading to error and diminished customer service response. In addition, maintaining a full complement of seven is difficult because the job is part time and employees are typically looking for full time employment.

This position was initiated in 2005. Prior to that time the simpler role of dispatcher only was in part covered by transit operators and did not include scheduling or supervisor duties. Since inception the role has changed, intensified and matured responding to growth and change of the transit business. The staffing response to the change has not kept up. This is a key work unit requiring a mix of full-time and part-time non-union staff to be effective.

The Administrative Plan of the Public Transit Operations Review spoke to this role and provided the following analysis:

"Under the current Peterborough Transit operating environment, these positions play a key role in ensuring the safe operation of the downtown terminal and helping to ensure efficient on-time transit service delivery.

The fact that these positions have only part-time status presents difficulties in attracting and retaining quality candidates. Potential candidates with the necessary skills and experience may be reluctant to leave full time positions for part time status with hours limited to 26 per week.

Peterborough Transit management has submitted a budget proposal to adjust the complement from 7 part time positions to 2 full-time and 4 part-time positions. The creation of at least 2 full-time positions would “raise the bar” in terms of the quality of staff; would motivate part-time staff to aspire to full-time status and would help to attract better qualified candidates to this position.”

This matter was also identified in the 2013 proposed Budget as a “below the line” item (Pg 187 of the Highlights Book). One of the complaints that staff hear from both users and Councilors is the lack of supervisory staff available “on the floor” to either provide direction or deal with complaints. The Dispatch/Scheduler Supervisors are the front line supervisors and, accordingly, it is this group that needs to be strengthened if we are to respond to the concerns expressed by users, Councillors and the Plan consultants.

6. Transit Operations Supervisor-Project Co-coordinator

The Plan is extremely comprehensive with eighty-seven recommendations affecting every aspect of transit service delivery. The implementation and ultimately the success of the Plan will require a significant time commitment by Staff. Route restructuring and level of service increases require staff resources for planning, testing, adjusting infrastructure such as transit stops as well as staff recruitment, roster development and assignment. In addition, public education and marketing, including standard and social media outlets, will be required to ensure awareness of the revised public services.

Existing staff resources cannot complete all of the work recommended in the Plan. The transit service is managed by a small team (three Operations Supervisors and one Operations Manager) who deliver every aspect of the operation including but not limited to:

- staff recruitment, training, schedule and run cuts
- administration of payroll, administering the collective agreement
- risk management including loss prevention, CVOR compliance, occupational health/safety, vehicle accident investigation
- asset management for fleet/transit terminal/transit garage and on-street shelters/stops
- liaison with principal customers such as Trent U, SSFC and school board
- technology such as on-board GPS/voice over internet telephones/automatic vehicle response and electronic fare boxes
- administration of purchasing including tender/ RFP preparation
- resolving all requests for service.

These four positions are on-call every hour that transit service is operating seven days a week. It is not uncommon to begin work at 5:00 am, complete a standard eight hour day only to return to work the same evening to investigate, for example, an accident/incident involving the transit fleet.

The transit service continues to grow and through the Plan will see significant expansion. The Administrative portion of the Plan recognized this changing/expanded environment and has recommended:

“That Peterborough Transit, in consideration of the various changes to processes and procedures outlined above, carry out a detailed review of the operations supervisor positions to re-align duties and responsibilities.”

Even to complete this one recommendation to review internal staff duties is significant and will require concentrated effort.

To achieve the delivery of all the actions set out in the Plan, it is recommended that one new staff position entitled Transit Operations Supervisor-Projects Co-ordinator be approved in the Transportation Division operating budget. If necessary this position could be a contract position serving for five years to the horizon year of the Plan which is currently the end of 2017.

7. Purchase of Transit Buses

Peterborough Transit maintains a fleet of 49 buses for the delivery of conventional transit services. All buses are the standard 40 foot in length. Thirty-four (69 percent) of these buses are fully accessible and have an average age of 6.3 years. There are 15 (31 percent) non-accessible buses in the fleet, with an average age of 23.9 years, ranging in age from 21 to 29 years.

The overall average age of the fleet is 11.6 years. Elements of the fleet are maintained well beyond the anticipated life of a conventional transit bus of 18 years, which is considered a standard by many transit systems across Canada.

No new buses have been acquired since 2009. The oldest (1983 and 1984) buses should have been replaced by now. Also no new bus orders have been placed so far in 2012 and the lead time for delivery is approximately 13 months. Therefore to bring the replacement program up to date, an order for six replacement buses should be placed immediately for delivery in 2013. This order would replace the six oldest buses.

The 2012 Capital budget carried funds for the purchase of 2 replacement buses. The draft 2013 budget also has 2 buses included therefore funding is required for an added two buses.

In the short term, the Plan recommends that with new replacement buses the short term proposed service enhancements can be accommodated. Six new replacement buses will be in full operation reducing the number of older part-time buses required for spares and back-up. This strategy will accommodate the 2013 and 2014 service delivery. To the end of the Plan's service life, the fleet will have to be expanded to maintain operation and acceptable spare bus ratio.

8. Purchase of Bus for Community Bus Service Delivery

For Community Bus service delivery to be most effective the Plan has recommended the purchase a small low-floor accessible purpose-built vehicle rather than operate with a high-floor lift equipped Handi-Van vehicle. This will help speed up the service and increase the overall accessibility.

9. Purchase of Handi-Vans

Peterborough Transit has a fleet of ten vehicles providing transit services to persons with disabilities. Five of these vehicles (2001 and 2002) are low floor fully accessible vehicles and five (1999 and 2009) are high-floor provided with lift equipment. The policy is to purchase low floor transit buses; however adhering to this policy has not been possible in recent years, due to the difficulty in sourcing a reliable low-floor specialized vehicle. The latest acquisitions of the four 2009 vehicles were high floor lift-equipped vehicles. Under this contract, the City has an option to purchase an additional 10 high floor vehicles by 2014.

The average age of these vehicles is 7.6 years, the targeted age for the specialized fleet is 5 years. Currently 6 of these vehicles are in excess of 5 years.

Of the total fleet of ten specialized vans, seven are required for daily service leaving a spare ratio of 30 percent. However due to the age and unreliability of the low floor vehicles, having seven vans available for daily service is a challenge. As a result, the Plan has recommended that the five low floor vehicles and the 1999 high floor van, be replaced immediately by more reliable high floor lift-equipped vehicles.

The 2012 Capital Budget (Item 5-11.03) contains an approved allocation of \$566,000 originally intended to fund two low-floor buses but, because high floor lift-equipped vehicles are cheaper to purchase, this funding will be sufficient to purchase the acquisition of the required 6 high floor lift-equipped vehicles.

Delivery of the vans in 2013 will improve the reliability of Handi-Van service and reduce the average age of the specialized fleet to approximately two years.

SUMMARY

The Public Transit Operations Review contains eighty-seven recommendations to guide public transit service delivery over the five year life of the Plan. Staff has completed an Implementation Plan to deliver the service changes.

The Plan was presented after the 2013 draft Operating and Capital Budgets were printed. To initiate the Plan, and implement the 2013 recommendations, fourteen budget changes are recommended. The proposed general transit fare increase

implemented at the beginning of the year is projected to generate enough fare revenue to offset the added operations costs associated with the service delivery.

Submitted by,

W. H. Jackson
Director, Utility Services

Contact Name:
J.N. Kimble CET
Manager, Transportation
Phone – 742-7777 Ext. 1895
Fax – 876-4621
E-Mail – jkimble@peterborough.ca

Attachment:

Appendix A – USDIR12-016 Peterborough Public Transit Plan-Final Report and
Implementation Plan



City of
Peterborough

TO: Members of the Committee of the Whole

FROM: W. H. Jackson, Director of Utility Services

MEETING DATE: November 05, 2012

SUBJECT: Report USDIR12-016
Peterborough Public Transit Operations Review –Final Report
and Implementation Plan

PURPOSE

A report to recommend the Final Report and the Implementation Plan for The Peterborough Public Transit Operations Review be adopted as the Financial, Planning and Operating Guideline for the City's public transit service over the next five-year period to 2017.

RECOMMENDATIONS

That Council approve the recommendations outlined in Report USDIR12-016, dated November 5, 2012, of the Director of Utility Services, as follows:

- a) That the Peterborough Public Transit Operations Review Final Report as prepared by Dillon Consulting dated October 2012 attached to Report USDIR12-016 as Appendix A, be adopted as the Financial, Planning and Operating Guideline for the City's public transit service over the next five-year period to 2017;
- b) That the Summary of Recommendations and Implementation Plan Summary attached as Appendix C to Report USDIR12-016 be approved in principle to guide the work plan for the Transportation Division/ Public Transit Section;
- c) That one new staff position entitled Transit Operations Supervisor-Projects Co-ordinator be considered for approval as part of the City's 2013 Budget review

process to provide required resources to complete the Implementation Plan in the timeframes illustrated; and

- d) That as part of the 2013 Operating and Capital Budgets review process staff identify amendments required to the Public Transit 2013 draft submission required to begin carrying out the recommended Implementation Plan.

BUDGET AND FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The implementation of the recommendations contained in the Public Transit Operations Review will have both operating and capital financial implications beginning in 2013 and continuing through the plan's five year duration up to and including 2017. Future year's budgets will clearly outline financial impacts of implementing the plan and Council will have the ability to modify the plans subject to Budget discussions.

The Plan is a balance of additional services offset by added and increased revenues.

Over the five-year life of the plan the net municipal investment in operations in Conventional Public Transit Services would increase from \$3.89 million in 2013 to an estimated \$4.64 million in 2017 - an increase of \$0.75 million which equates to 3.5% per year increase.

For Handi-Van and Accessible Services the net municipal investment in operations would increase from \$0.76 million in 2013 to \$0.96 million in 2017 - an increase of \$0.20 million which equates to 5.0% per year increase.

Additional capital resources over the first five years of the Plan includes the funding of fifteen new transit buses (nine replacement, six expansion) for conventional transit as well as the replacement of five Handi-Van vehicles.

In addition, the Review recommends the development of a business case for a new Downtown Transit Terminal with required funding allocated in the 10-Year Capital Program as well as recommending Council endorse the completion of a new Municipal Operations Centre.

BACKGROUND

The Public Transit Operations Review was initiated in September 2011. Through RFP P-26-11 Dillon Consulting were retained to complete the Project which has become known as 'The Route Ahead'. Dillon undertook a comprehensive review of Peterborough's transit services and has developed a service plan covering the period

2012 – 2017 including an assessment and recommendations on Conventional Fixed Route Transit, TransCab and Handi-Van services.

The Project was administered through a Steering Committee consisting of

- Councillor Vass as Chair;
- Councillor McWilliams;
- Councillor Beamer;
- Chief Administrative Officer Brian Horton; and
- Director of Utility Services Wayne Jackson.

At the July 30, 2012 Committee of the Whole, Dillon presented the Draft Final Report of 'The Route Ahead'. The draft study report represented over 150 pages of information, analysis and recommendations. The scope of the recommendations are wide ranging including a discussion on the downtown transit terminal, proposed efficiency and service improvements as well as the implementation of a new Community Bus service.

Given that the Project information is complex and implementation of the recommendations would have significant impacts on individuals or groups of transit users it was determined that a Special Committee of the Whole Meeting be held on September 19, 2012 to receive public input on the Peterborough Public Transit Operations Review Draft Report. The meeting attracted significant public interest, and thirty-four delegations addressed Council and the recommendations contained in the Draft Final Report.

The Project Consultants reviewed the concerns/comments expressed at the Special Committee of the Whole meeting and amended their report where they felt changes were warranted.

The Public Transit Operations Review Final Report was received by the City on October 10, 2012. The report contains a total of eighty-seven recommendations and action items covering all facets of the public transit system. A copy of the complete report is attached as Appendix A.

Appendix B is the Executive Summary for the Report. The summary provides a concise overview of the Project as well as discussion of the key conclusions, recommendations and presents the five-year service plan.

Each member of Project Steering Committee has had the opportunity to review the Final Report and the Project Consultant presented the report to the Committee at its meeting of Friday October 19, 2012.

1. Implementation Plan

City Staff have reviewed the Final Report and its eighty-seven recommendations/action items. To provide direction for implementation, Appendix C - Summary of Recommendations and Implementation Plan has been prepared. This chart provides commentary, status and staff's proposed priorities for implementation for each of the recommendations.

The Implementation Plan provides a guide to the delivery of the five year service plan. Many of the major action items will require additional reports to Council for approval and inclusion in future year capital and operating budgets.

2. Staff Resources Required to implement

The Implementation Plan with its priorities as shown in Appendix C represents a significant time commitment by Staff. Route restructuring and level of service increases require Staff resources for planning, testing, adjusting infrastructure such as transit stops as well as Staff recruitment, roster development and assignment. In addition, public education and marketing will be required to ensure awareness of the revised public services. To achieve the delivery of the actions set out in Appendix B, staff are recommending that one new staff position entitled Transit Operations Supervisor-Projects Co-ordinator be considered for approval as part of the City's 2013 Budget review process to provide required resources to complete the Implementation Plan during the five-year life of the Service Plan.

The draft 2013 Budget has already gone to print and does not reflect any of the recommendations proposed by Dillon. As part of the detailed 2013 Budget review staff will recommend required changes to the Transit submissions to reflect the implementation plan and the new staff position.

Representatives from Dillon consultants will attend the November 5, 2012 Committee of the Whole meeting to help answer questions.

Submitted by,

W. H. Jackson
Director of Utility Services

Contact Name:
W. H. Jackson, P. Eng.
Director of Utility Services
Phone – 705 742 7777 Ext. 1894
Fax – 705 876 4621
E-Mail – wjackson@peterborough.ca

Appendix A: Peterborough Public Transit Operations Review – The Route Ahead Final Report October 2012

Appendix B: Peterborough Public Transit Operations Review- The Route Ahead Executive Summary

Appendix C: Peterborough Public Transit Operations Review – Summary Recommendation and Implementation Plan

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The City of Peterborough has a strong history of supporting public transit services for all members of the community. Over the past decade ridership has grown by 62 percent on conventional services and with a current mode share of 4.5 percent, the City is on target to achieve its goal of having 6 percent of all trips within Peterborough to be on public transit by 2021.

The Dillon Consulting team was engaged by the City to conduct an operational review of current conventional and Handi-Van services and provide advice on strategies to improve efficiency, increase ridership and ensure that all residents and visitors have effective transit access to employment, school, shopping, services, recreation and cultural activities within the community.

There are many positive aspects to the current transit services and in a comparison with a peer group of Ontario municipalities, the performance of Peterborough Transit ranks high. The revenue/cost (R/C) ratio is 49 percent, transit ridership per capita is 37.92 and the average number of boardings per revenue vehicle hour is 29.23. This suggests a system that is meeting financial performance targets and is effective in capturing a reasonable share of the travel market.

Service innovations include the use of TransCab for areas of low demand, employment specials, and express services to post-secondary institutions. The City has developed an effective partnership with the Student Association at Trent University which has resulted in a strong base of transit customers and transit service levels which benefit the entire community.

The conventional transit system is based on route running times of 40 or 80 minutes with 12 routes operating in a radial pattern focused on the downtown bus terminal. There is a service frequency of 40 minutes between buses during all hours of operation. While the service is effective, this is considered a long wait between buses during peak periods and some crowding and schedule adherence issues have resulted. An exception is the Trent express routes which provide 20 minute service between the downtown and the University at certain periods as warranted by demand.

The bus terminal was constructed many years ago as part of a municipal parking structure when the City operated 35 foot buses. The design requires the current 40 foot buses to back out of their bays in groups of four and this reversing operation creates major problems for system operational efficiency and user security. Modern bus terminal designs feature 'drive through' operation and are capable of providing lower station dwell times which allows for enhanced transit productivity.

A key study recommendation is for the City to initiate the necessary planning activities to develop a future transit terminal as a mobility hub and catalyst for downtown intensification plans. Recognizing that such a facility will require funding support from senior governments and will take several years to realize, the transit options for the next five years assume continued use of the downtown terminal.

It is also noted that the construction of a new Municipal Operations Centre has not yet been approved. A modern well equipped maintenance facility with the proper space for the storage and maintenance of the entire fleet of conventional and specialized vehicles is urgently required. Another study recommendation is for staff to bring forward a report seeking approval for this facility.

The study has recommended a number of efficiency improvements with the resulting savings in bus hours applied to improving the frequency of service during peak periods on four of the twelve routes. Key efficiency measures are the combination of the Trent East Bank Express service with the Route 9 Nichols Park; the conversion of Route 12 Major Bennett to a peak period employment special service for the industrial area; and the elimination of the first run on Saturday mornings for all routes.

The 40 minute frequency between buses is a significant deterrent to ridership growth and it is proposed that 20 minute service be introduced on four of the twelve routes for 6 peak period hours weekdays. A fifth route (Route 9) will also operate at a 20 minute frequency during the school year with its integration with the West Bank Express service. This strategy is proposed to be extended to all routes over the 5 year life of this plan, providing the capacity and level of service needed to reach the City's transit mode share target of 6 percent by 2017. This will be subject to achieving financial and ridership growth targets established by the City. It is also proposed that bus routes be interlined at the terminal to improve the convenience of passenger transfers and the reliability of the bus schedules.

Peterborough Transit has had considerable success in making its conventional service fully accessible and in encouraging registered Handi-Van users to make use of this service. Nevertheless, increased pressures on the expensive door-to-door service can be anticipated with the aging of the population (and the increased incidence of disability as people age), Peterborough's attraction as a retirement destination, and the requirements of Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities (AODA) legislation.

The study proposes that the City augment its dedicated vans with a limited increase in the use of taxi's which are less costly per trip (particularly in the shoulder periods) and also consider the introduction of a taxi scrip program which has been used by several municipalities to increase spontaneous trip making by persons with disabilities. It is further proposed to introduce a new Community Bus service which will benefit both Handi-Van registrants and the general population of seniors.

Two Community Bus routes have been designed to operate Monday through Saturday from 8:40am until 4:40pm on routes that will serve large numbers of seniors and persons with disabilities. Productivity targets are established for this new service and it is suggested that one Community Bus route be introduced for a one year trial and the service be continued/expanded based on the success in meeting these targets.

The Route Ahead for Peterborough involves building on the existing success of the system. Ridership has been growing over the past few years on conventional transit and the service modifications and move towards some 20 minute peak period service will accelerate this trend. This strategy will also be important in helping to further migrate some existing Handi-Van trips to the accessible low-floor system and to manage rising costs on Handi-Van that will occur with an aging population. The introduction of a new Community Bus option further adds to an efficient 'family of services' approach to public transit in Peterborough.

Based on the efficiency improvements outlined in the report and the anticipated ridership growth, it is expected that the 2013 budget requirements for Peterborough Transit (with service implementation) will be similar to 2012 levels. Recognizing that the last general fare increase occurred in 2009 and that service level improvements are being implemented with this plan, an increase of \$0.25 on the cash fare is suggested along with adjustments for passes.

Throughout the life of this plan, it is recommended that the City continue to implement additional 20 minute peak frequency services by adding two routes per year (subject to ridership performance targets being achieved). Ridership performance should be monitored and the number of hours when 20 minute service is available should be increased in response to demand. This will help the City achieve its 2021 transit mode share target early by providing the capacity and service level required to accommodate over a million additional passengers. **Table E-1** and **Table E-2** below illustrates the forecasted ridership, operating cost, revenue and financial performance for the recommended plan assuming a January 1, 2013 implementation for the conventional and Handi-Van services respectively.

For the introduction of Community Bus, a capital expense will be incurred; however, it is recommended that the hours to operate this service be allocated from the existing Handi-Van operation. If the proposed one year trial is successful, a second community bus route should be implemented, and this will require new service hours being added to the system. An increase in the use of taxi services for Handi-Van trips will help mitigate the budget impacts.

Table E-1 - Five-Year Service Plan for Peterborough Conventional Transit

Performance Measures	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017
Revenue Service Hours	106,714	106,714	107,552	110,540	113,528	116,516	120,062
Total Operating Costs	\$8,970,200	\$9,149,602	\$9,397,582	\$9,821,912	\$10,259,456	\$10,710,573	\$11,222,476
Total Revenues	\$4,181,832	\$4,321,032	\$4,687,130	\$4,947,448	\$5,229,729	\$5,482,745	\$5,730,024
Cost Recovery	47%	47%	50%	50%	51%	51%	51%
Net Operating Cost	\$4,788,368	\$4,828,570	\$4,710,452	\$4,874,463	\$5,029,728	\$5,227,828	\$5,492,453
Gas Tax ³	\$805,078	\$813,129	\$821,260	\$829,473	\$837,767	\$846,145	\$854,607
Municipal Investment	\$3,983,290	\$4,015,441	\$3,889,191	\$4,044,991	\$4,191,960	\$4,381,683	\$4,637,846
Service Area Population	78,700	79,230	79,760	80,290	80,820	81,350	81,880
Municipal Investment per Capita	\$50.61	\$50.68	\$48.76	\$50.38	\$51.87	\$53.86	\$56.64
Ridership	3,186,271	3,307,444	3,397,869	3,587,027	3,793,370	3,982,315	4,172,717
Ridership Growth		3.8%	2.7%	5.6%	5.8%	5.0%	4.8%
Ridership per Capita	40.49	41.74	42.60	44.68	46.94	48.95	50.96
Ridership per Service Hour	29.86	30.99	31.59	32.45	33.41	34.18	34.75

Note: 2011 budget used as base service for hours, operating costs, revenue and ridership

Note: All operating costs are increased by 2 percent per year to reflect rising fuel and cost of living

Note: One-time fare increase averaging 10 percent was assumed for 2013

Table E-2 - Five-Year Service Plan for Peterborough Handi-Van and Accessible Services

Performance Measures	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017
Revenue Service Hours	14,600	14,815	14,730	17,050	17,106	17,315	17,365
Total Operating Costs	\$1,017,000	\$1,052,706	\$1,009,850	\$1,192,727	\$1,214,419	\$1,247,792	\$1,264,132
Total Revenues	\$73,100	\$74,276	\$81,632	\$107,185	\$117,558	\$128,799	\$129,386
Cost Recovery	7%	7%	8%	9%	10%	10%	10%
Net Operating Cost	\$943,900	\$978,430	\$928,218	\$1,085,542	\$1,096,862	\$1,118,993	\$1,134,747
Gas Tax ²	\$169,400	\$170,247	\$171,098	\$171,954	\$172,813	\$173,678	\$174,546
Municipal Investment	\$774,500	\$808,183	\$757,119	\$913,588	\$924,048	\$945,315	\$960,201
Service Area Population	78,700	79,230	79,760	80,290	80,820	81,350	81,880
Passenger Trips (<i>minus conventional transit</i>)	34,800	35,360	40,329	52,388	57,877	63,742	63,996
Municipal Investment per Passenger Trip	\$22.26	\$22.86	\$18.77	\$17.44	\$15.97	\$14.83	\$15.00
Municipal Investment per Capita	\$9.84	\$10.20	\$9.49	\$11.38	\$11.43	\$11.62	\$11.73
Passenger Trips per Capita	0.44	0.45	0.51	0.65	0.72	0.78	0.78
Passenger Trips per Service Hour	2.38	2.39	2.74	3.07	3.38	3.68	3.69

APPENDIX C

Peterborough Transit Operations Review

Summary of Recommendations

Implementation Plan

Item	Reference	Recommendation	Staff Comments	Status	Priority
Recommendations in Section 8.0 (Strategic Directions)					
1	8.6.1	That Peterborough Transit continue to operate a radial based system with a secondary emphasis on other key nodes including the Lansdowne Mall and Chemong corridor	Provides clear short term direction for base conventional public transit route pattern. Continuation of current delivery model. Strengthens linkages to recognized service nodes.	Complete	High
2	8.6.2	That Peterborough Transit continue to operate on running times of 40 or 80 minutes until such time as a replacement for the current terminal can be implemented	Clear strategic direction for conventional public transit base levels of service.	Complete	High
3	8.6.3	That the following design principles guide the development of the proposed route structure: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Continue the agreement with the Trent Student Association to provide express services;• Continue to utilize TransCab to provide transit coverage to remote areas and areas of low demand;• Provide express service to Fleming College while working with the	Solid design principles consistent with directions from past projects including the approved Transportation Master Plan. Principles are achievable. Provides focus for conventional fixed route transit service design as well as delivery principals to be worked on and achieved through the five year service plan period.	On-going though five year life of Service Plan	High

Item	Reference	Recommendation	Staff Comments	Status	Priority
		<p>student association on the adoption of a Universal pass program;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provide employment specials to low density employment areas beyond the reach of conventional routes. Provide a basic weekday peak period level of service (with a performance target of 10 boardings per hour or more) and seek partnership agreements with key employers for any service outside of this base; and • Adjust routes to provide more direct service where possible and support intensification plans along the Lansdowne and Chemong corridors. 			
4	8.6.4	That Peterborough Transit only provide service outside the City based on a 100 percent cost recovery basis;	Appropriate principal for delivery of any cross-boundary service extensions which may arise in response to requests for service from County destinations.	No formal requests for service received to date.	Low
5	8.6.5	That Peterborough Transit initiate discussions with GO Transit on a service and fare integration strategy to better accommodate interregional travel to/from Peterborough;	This action will strengthen the interface between local and inter-regional travel improving quality of service to transit customers and encouraging new users. Reinforces Transportation Master Plan strategy.	Not yet started	Low
6	8.6.6	That Peterborough Transit continue to operate transit services using 40 ft buses with the exception of Community Bus or	Continuation of existing policy.	Complete	High

Item	Reference	Recommendation	Staff Comments	Status	Priority
		Employment Specials.			
Recommendations in Section 9.1 (Service Standards)					
7	9.1.1	That Peterborough Transit revise its service coverage standard to be based on a 450 metre walking distance to better reflect a 5 minute walking time of an aging population.	Current policy as defined in Official Plan is coverage to within 500 m of 95% of City's developed urban area. Revised route structure will need to meet this coverage with additional service delivery required in some areas.	Initiate in conjunction with revised route plan and OP Review.	Medium
8	9.1.2	That Peterborough Transit separate the Express Route classification into two separate route types: Post-Secondary Express (routes focused on Trent University and Fleming College) and Employment Express (routes focused on large industrial/employment areas).	Following current practice, this principal permits separation of the type of service provided allowing custom service delivery	Complete	High
9	9.1.3.	That Peterborough Transit revise its utilization standard in the Official Plan to reflect the following: Each transit route should achieve the following minimum utilization levels, i.e. passengers per vehicle hour: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Weekday: Base Routes: 25 boardings per revenue vehicle hour • Saturday Base Routes: 15 boardings per revenue vehicle hour • Sunday Base Routes: 10 boardings per revenue vehicle hour • Post-Secondary Express Routes: 25 boardings per revenue vehicle hour 	Practical service standard for measuring performance and determining if a route should continue to be operated.	Complete Implement as part of OP Review	High

Item	Reference	Recommendation	Staff Comments	Status	Priority
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Employment Express Routes: 15 boardings per revenue vehicle hour. 			
10	9.1.4.	That new routes or routes with improved frequency be given 6 to 12 months to reach to minimum performance targets.	Recognized standard for monitoring new or improved routes.	Complete	High
Recommendations in Section 9.2 (conventional Transit Service – Weekday)					
11	9.2.1.	That Peterborough Transit restructure its routes and services based on the proposed service alignment identified in Figure 17;	Proposed route restructuring requires detail design, testing and changing infrastructure such as stops and shelters prior to implementation.	Not yet started	High
12	9.2.2.	That Peterborough Transit initiate negotiations with Trent University students association to seek a cost sharing and service level agreement for combining the East Bank Express and Route 9;	Agreement needs to be reached with the customer to ensure that this service strategy is financially and operationally feasible.	Not yet started	High
13	9.2.3.	That Peterborough Transit operate at a 20 minute frequency during the weekday AM peak period (7:00 am and 9:00 am) and PM peak period (2:00 pm and 6:00 pm) on the four base routes (Route 2, 7, 8 and 10);	Peak period service enhancement can be initiated following service design and evaluation including added operating staff and buses for service delivery.	Not yet started	High
14	9.2.4.	That Peterborough Transit operate a minimum 40 minute frequency service on all routes during all hours of operation;	Represents continuation of existing service delivery.	Complete	High
15	9.2.5.	That Peterborough Transit continue its U-Pass program with the Student Association at Trent University and seek to extend a similar program	Require discussion and agreement with representatives of faculty and staff of the university	Not yet started	Medium

Item	Reference	Recommendation	Staff Comments	Status	Priority
		to faculty and staff;			
16	9.2.6.	That Peterborough Transit continue to operate a Fleming College express service and pursue any further service improvements through negotiation of a U-Pass arrangement with the Student Association;	Staff has offered to assist Fleming Student Association with understanding of U Pass Program.	Initiated	Medium
17	9.2.7.	That Peterborough Transit continue to operate TransCab services to low-demand areas;	Represents continuation of existing service delivery.	Complete	High
18	9.2.8.	That Peterborough Transit continue to operate the Technology Drive Express and identify partnership approaches for any additional service hours outside the base weekday peak periods;	Continuation of existing service delivery. Will require staff resources to investigate business partnerships for expanded service	Not yet started	Low
19	9.2.9.	That Peterborough Transit maintain the existing weekday start and end time of 6:00am and 11:20pm;	Continuation of existing service delivery.	Complete	High
20	9.2.10	That Peterborough Transit offer an extended time transfer of 90 minutes;	Revised service design required including farebox software adjustments and customer awareness as well as revised printed material to inform customers	Not yet started	High
21	9.2.11.	That Peterborough Transit inter-line routes at the downtown terminal.	Need to complete design of routes to be paired, re-design staff work assignments to reflect revised work, complete customer awareness and marketing plan prior to roll-out of the service change.	Not yet started	High

Item	Reference	Recommendation	Staff Comments	Status	Priority
Recommendations in Section 9.3 (Conventional Transit Service – Saturday)					
22	9.3.1.	That Peterborough Transit adopt the weekday route structure for Saturdays.	Implement in conjunction with weekday route changes (Recommendation 11)	Not yet started	High
23	9.3.2.	That Peterborough Transit operate on Saturdays between 7:20 am and 11:20 pm.	Delay start time eliminate first trip, 40 minutes of service. Redesign Staff assignments, change schedules and complete customer awareness program.	Not yet started	High
24	9.3.3.	That Peterborough Transit operate base routes at 40 minute frequencies all day Saturday.	Continuation of existing service delivery.	Complete	High
25	9.3.4.	That Peterborough Transit operate Route 12 for six hours only on Saturdays.	Implement in conjunction with weekday level of service changes, reduce service hours change schedules redesign staff work assignments complete customer awareness.	Not yet started	High
Recommendations in Section 9.4 (Conventional Transit Service – Sunday/Holiday)					
26	9.4.1.	That Peterborough Transit adopt the weekday base route structure on Sundays	Implement in conjunction with weekday route changes (Recommendation 11)	Not yet started	High
27	9.4.2.	That Peterborough Transit operate base routes at 40 minute frequencies all day Sunday between 8:00 am and 7:20 pm.	Continuation of existing service delivery.	Complete	High
Recommendations in Section 9.5 (Medium-Term Conventional Transit Strategy)					
28	9.5.1.	That Peterborough Transit progressively stages the implementation of 20 minute peak period service on additional route	Review initial 20 minute peak service to ensure delivery meeting performance standards	To be started following	Medium

Item	Reference	Recommendation	Staff Comments	Status	Priority
		pairs until the entire system is upgraded.		initial route review	
29	9.5.2.	That Peterborough Transit considers extending the 20 minute service frequency during the midday periods in response to demand.	Monitor revised routes and peak period 20 minute frequency. Budget impact.	Not yet started	Low
30	9.5.3.	That Peterborough Transit monitor ridership on the first and last runs on all service days and look to extend the existing hours of service in response to increases in demand.	Good administrative practice to ensure performance matches demand.	Started	Low
31	9.5.4.	That Peterborough Transit extend service on holidays in which retail and employment areas are open in order to meet potential demand on those days.	Design and deliver holiday service.	Not yet started	Medium
Recommendations in Section 9.6 (Transit Fare Strategy)					
32	9.6.1.	That Peterborough Transit implements a general fare increase at the same time as the service improvements are introduced.	Design and recommend fare increase, to be implemented along with other high priority service changes in late spring 2013	Complete for 2013 budget review	High
33	9.6.2.	That Peterborough Transit adjust cash fares in 25 cent increments only.	Strategic approach for cash fares. Current practice, for last two fare increases.	Complete	High
34	9.6.3.	That small fare increases be completed annually in line with municipal budget processes to avoid large 'one-time increases' or catch-up.	Increases to pass fare media only. Recognized strategy ensures revenues keep pace with fixed cost increases.	Not yet started	Medium
35	9.6.4.	That the City of Peterborough develop and implement a Transit Affordability program for Peterborough residents.	Corporate program designed to be inclusive of all with pass price geared to household income. Replace OW/ODSP specific	Not yet started	Medium

Item	Reference	Recommendation	Staff Comments	Status	Priority
			program. Requires significant Staff time, complex Program.		
36	9.6.5.	That Peterborough Transit Staff continue to approach Fleming College administration and the Student Union to implement a U-Pass program similar to the Trent University Program.	Initial contact with Fleming Student Administrative Council's Student Services and Outreach in Sept. 2012, will pursue. (Recommendation 16)	Underway	Medium
Recommendations in Section 13.1 (Accessible Conventional Bus Service)					
37	13.1.1.	<p>That Peterborough Transit continue to promote the use of the conventional services to existing and potential clients of Handi-Van services as a short-term measure. This would include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Updating all Handi-Van information to provide a section on the current accessibility features of conventional transit including information on how to use the services; • Expanding and enhancing the accessibility information on the Transit Map and City Transit web site and, over time, adding communications elements which are more directly focused on seniors; • Taking steps to ensure updated and current information is available on general service accessibility (e.g., any change in availability of accessible buses, bus shelter locations and bus stop conditions); • Conducting occasional 	Community outreach, customer information and marketing of services to be strengthened. Added resources and Staff time required to design and deliver the community based information program.	On-going	Medium

Item	Reference	Recommendation	Staff Comments	Status	Priority
		demonstrations of low floor bus accessibility for groups of seniors and persons with disabilities;			
38	13.1.2.	That Peterborough Transit expand the current program for the ongoing upgrading of high volume and other important bus stops to improve accessibility. Improvements include landing pads, paved connections to sidewalks, benches, shelters or other accessibility enhancements. In conjunction with this program, an accessibility inventory of all bus stops should be developed to guide improvements as well as to be able to provide information to customers. The bus stop improvement program is proposed as a medium to long-term measure.	Initiate steps to produce accessible transit stops. Initial requirements include inventory of existing facilities and design of a standard for accessible transit stop. These works have been initiated.	On-going	Medium
39	13.1.3.	That Peterborough Transit provide an incentive to Handi-Van service clients to use conventional transit service under conditions (e.g., non-winter seasons, daylight hours, accessible bus stops at origin and destination) in which they are able to use the service. The incentive could be in the form of free passage for clients who have a time limited (e.g., six months) photo identification pass issued by Peterborough Transit. This incentive is suggested as a short-term measure.	Program design including customer outreach required. Capital expenditure for development of photo identification including acquisition of equipment.	Not yet started	Medium

Item	Reference	Recommendation	Staff Comments	Status	Priority
40	13.1.4.	That Peterborough Transit offer a travel training program to encourage and assist persons with disabilities to use conventional transit. It is suggested that this be a medium to long-term measure so more experience can be gained from others in the industry. It is also suggested that opportunities to provide this service through partnerships with external agencies should be explored. A generic version of Travel Training may become available in 2012 or 2013, through the Province for use by Ontario Transit systems.	Outreach program to be designed and delivered. Requires Staff resources to research best practices establish program parameters and initiate.	Not yet started	Low
41	13.1.5.	That Peterborough Transit clarify through signage definition between priority and courtesy seating and adopt a policy of picking up a person with a disability if they cannot be accommodated on a fixed route service due to capacity issues and when the next bus will arrive over 20 minutes later.	Requires Staff time for Program design and delivery including customer service information and practices.	Not yet started	Low
Recommendations in Section 13.2 (Taxi Scrip)					
42	13.2.1.	That Peterborough Transit initiate a taxi scrip program based on a 50 percent cost share with a municipal contribution limit of \$40,000 annually for up to 8,000 trips using taxi vouchers. Handi-Van users would be able to purchase \$20.00 in taxi vouchers once per month subject to the municipal budget limit	Requires Staff resources to research best practices establish program parameters and initiate program.	Not yet started	Medium

Item	Reference	Recommendation	Staff Comments	Status	Priority
43	13.2.2.	That Peterborough Transit consult with all licensed taxi companies concerning program design.	See Recommendation 42.	Not yet started	Medium
Recommendations in Section 13.3 (Community Bus)					
44	13.3.1.	That Peterborough Transit introduce the Community Bus service in consultation with seniors groups, persons with disabilities, other stakeholders and Handi-Van services staff.	Requires Staff resources to research best practices, design and staff the service, prepare marketing material, complete the community outreach and initiate the service.	Not yet started	High
45	13.3.2.	That in the short term a first Community Bus route be established on a one year trial basis and if a performance target of 7 rides per hour is achieved that a second route be introduced.	Reasonable time frame to determine if service meeting performance standards.	Not yet started	High
46	13.3.3.	That the Community Bus service be promoted to the target market, that dispatchers provide positive guidance and encouragement for registrants to use the service and that staff also adopt a target of one prescheduled Handi-Van Services trip being accommodated on each route cycle of the Community Bus.	Requires adjustment to standard operating procedures, Staff training and community outreach.	Not yet started	High
47	13.3.4.	That Peterborough Transit pursue partnership and sponsorship opportunities for Community Bus capital acquisitions and operations.	New policy, to date City has not pursued sponsors for acquisition of assets or assistance with operating costs.	Not yet started	Low
48	13.3.5.	That Peterborough operate the first route using resources from the existing Handi-Van service.	Assignment of operating staff to Community bus, which is achievable.	Not yet started	High

Item	Reference	Recommendation	Staff Comments	Status	Priority
49	13.3.6.	That Peterborough purchase a small low floor accessible vehicle (i.e. Arboc) for use in the Community Bus service; and that, as demand grows for Community Bus, Peterborough Transit should consider increasing the number of routes and operating at lower frequencies as well as potentially operating with conventional accessible buses of higher capacity (i.e. use of 30 foot transit buses).	Capital budget impact, technical specifications for small bus to be prepared, RFP to be written and issued for procurement.	Not yet started	High
Recommendations in Section 13.4 (Pre-scheduled Door-to-Door Service)					
50	13.4.1.	That Peterborough Transit improve the efficiency and expand the delivery of prescheduled door-to-door service through increased use of contracted taxis in the short-term with a target of providing an additional 3,000 to 4,000 annual trips and accommodating 10 percent to 15 percent of all Handi-Van trips on taxis within 3 years	Staff resources to review practice, discussion with taxi service providers, operating agreements to be prepared and customer outreach, education on the change to service delivery.	Not yet started	Medium
51	13.4.2.	That Peterborough Transit initiate discussions with all local taxi operators to seek their input and participation in the provision of scheduled door to door services.	See Recommendation 50	Not yet started	Medium
Recommendations in Section 13.5 (Eligibility and Registration)					
52	13.5.1.	That Peterborough Transit revise its eligibility criteria by introducing three categories of eligibility: Conditional, Unconditional and Temporary. These	Staff resources to determine the eligibility criteria and define the administrative parameters for implementation.	Not yet started	Low

Item	Reference	Recommendation	Staff Comments	Status	Priority
		should be based on a Family of Services concept.			
53	13.5.2.	That Peterborough Transit work with a contracted health care practitioner once a week (or as needed) to review applications and make decisions on eligibility.	New program will require scope of work and memorandum of understanding to retain technical support.	Not yet started	Low
54	13.5.3.	That Peterborough Transit ask more detailed questions in its application form regarding the ability to use the Family of Services and the need for an attendant.	Redesign of current application required.	Not yet started	Low
55	13.5.4.	That Peterborough Transit prepare for the 2014 AODA legislation by having policies and procedures in place that: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • always ensure that its Eligibility Application Process is completed within 14 days of receipt of each application; • allow temporary access to its service after 14 days of an application, if a decision has not been made; • has an independent appeal process in place; all appeal decisions must be made within 30 days of receipt of each appeal; • has a policy with respect to the collection, use and disclosure of personal information; and • has a procedure relating to the provision of temporary access to the service on compassionate grounds (prior to the 14 day eligibility 	Staff currently working through all AODA legislative requirements and implementation by defined compliance dates.	On-going	Medium

Item	Reference	Recommendation	Staff Comments	Status	Priority
		assessment period).			
56	13.5.5.	That Peterborough Transit continue to communicate Canadian Urban Transit Association CUTA, with the Ontario Public Transit Association OPTA and to watch the Metrolinx Web Site to determine if certain sets of eligibility criteria are emerging as Best Practices in the industry.	Staff to monitor industry standards through continued participation with transit associations.	Complete	Medium
Recommendations in Section 13.6 (Advisory Committee for Seniors and Persons with Disabilities)					
57	13.6.1.	That Peterborough continue to work with the Transportation Sub-Committee of the municipal Accessibility Advisory committee, for the purposes of assisting staff in the implementation of the 'family of services' delivery model.	Current practice.	On-going	High
Recommendations in Section 13.7 (No-Show Enforcement Policy)					
58	13.7.1.	That Peterborough Transit re-establish its 'No-show' policy and enforce penalties based on consistent violation of the policy.	Review former program, revise as required and reintroduce.	Not yet started	Medium
59	13.7.2.	That Peterborough Transit initiate an education program to inform registered Handi-Van users about the implications of consistent no-shows and late cancellations to the availability of service to others.	Staff resources needed to complete program design and delivery.	Not yet started	Medium
60	13.7.3.	That the Transit Sub-Committee of the municipal Accessibility Advisory Committee be charged with addressing	Reinstate former practice.	Not yet started	Medium

Item	Reference	Recommendation	Staff Comments	Status	Priority
		and providing advice to Transit management on customer complaint and issues including the 'no-shows'.			
Recommendations in Section 13.8 (Customer Information)					
61	13.8.1.	That Peterborough Transit designate fully accessible stops and note these on its print and web information materials.	Design of print and web materials required.	Not yet started	Low
62	13.8.2.	That Peterborough Transit offer a Travel Training Program, to be delivered through the local service agencies.	New Program requiring Staff resources to design and deliver. (See Recommendation 40)	Not yet started	Low
Recommendations from Section 16 (Administrative Review)					
63	16.4.1.	That Peterborough Transit acquire appropriate software for more efficient and cost effective scheduling of conventional transit service.	A 2012 work plan item started the initial investigation of various electronic rostering/scheduling systems. Included as proposed 2013 capital budget item.	Initiated	High
64	16.4.2.	That Peterborough Transit implement improvements to the Operator Recruitment program, which are more likely to attract candidates better suited to the role of transit operator, and which include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Change the license criteria from a "CZ" to "G" and train new staff to meet the "CZ" licensing requirements; • Change the hiring criteria to stress candidates with proven customer service skills; • To better attract quality candidates, 	Have begun to implement recruitment and retention strategies that strengthen commitment to work force and attract highest possible level of qualified staff.	On-going	Medium

Item	Reference	Recommendation	Staff Comments	Status	Priority
		<p>identify changes to the existing working conditions for part-time operators and evaluate the following options:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Establish a minimum guarantee for hours of work; • Consider limited improvements to fringe benefits; and • Conversion of some part time positions to full time extra board. 			
65	16.4.3.	That Peterborough Transit provide enhanced operator training by hiring a full-time Transit Training Coordinator with full license signing authority.	As transit grows requirement for full-time Staff training increases.	Not yet started	Medium
66	16.4.4.	That Peterborough Transit develop standards for Operator Performance targeted to improve customer service, safe work practices, punctuality and attendance.	Development of policies and performance standards would follow recruitment of full-time staff trainer to administer comprehensive program.	Not yet started	Low
67	16.4.5.	That Peterborough Transit implement improvements to operator performance management, including the development of an Attendance Management Program and provision of related staff training if required.	Development of Policy and Program to be in conjunction with Corporate Services/Human Resources Division	Not yet started	Low
68	16.4.6.	That Peterborough Transit carry out a complete review of the current payroll administration process to identify improvements which will save staff time, reduce errors and improve efficiency.	Administrative review of how internal service is delivered. To be completed in conjunction with Corporate Services Staff.	Not yet started	Medium

Item	Reference	Recommendation	Staff Comments	Status	Priority
69	16.4.7.	That Peterborough Transit undertake a complete review of the Peterborough Transit phone system to address the current limitations and provide efficient and cost effective solutions.	A 2012 work plan item initiated a review of existing six year old VOIP computerized phone system to determine requirements.	Initiated	Medium
70	16.4.8.	That Peterborough Transit acquire database software to improve management and analysis of all customer contacts.	Important to track customer contact/concerns as well as corrective action to enhance customer service and respond to requests for service.	Not yet started	Low
71	16.4.9.	That Peterborough Transit establish service standards for winter maintenance and ensure effective delivery	To ensure accessibility for all enhanced winter control is required.	Not yet started	Medium
72	16.4.10	That Peterborough Transit adjust the complement of Dispatch Supervisors from 7 part-time positions to 2 full-time and 4 part-time positions.	Former year recommendation (2009) to-date not approved (below the line) in operating budgets. Important to ensure consistency in this work unit.	Not yet started	High
73	16.4.11	That Peterborough Transit, in consideration of the various changes to processes and procedures outlined above, carry out a detailed review of the operations supervisor positions to re-align duties and responsibilities	For effective supervision and productive section management requires review of who does what.	Not yet started	Medium
Recommendations from Section 17.9 (Capital Asset Requirements)					
74	17.9.1.	That Utility Service Department staff to prepare a submission to council to seek urgent approval for the new Municipal Operations Centre and explore the opportunity for federal and/or provincial	Existing transit garage and maintenance facilities are outdated for fleet size and composition.	Not yet started	High

Item	Reference	Recommendation	Staff Comments	Status	Priority
		funding support.			
75	17.9.2.	That Peterborough Transit adjust the 10 Year capital budget for the Conventional Bus Replacement program to re-allocate the necessary funds to finance the acquisition of 15 new buses as outlined in Section 17.2.	Required to delivery enhanced services recommended in the service plan of this Review.	Not yet started	High
76	17.9.3.	That Peterborough Transit review the adequacy of funding for the bus refurbishing program to ensure planned expenditures match available funding.	Review for recommended inclusion in 2013 and future capital budgets. Have had success with refurbishing in past.	Not yet started	Medium
77	17.9.4.	That Peterborough Transit use six replacement buses to be acquired in 2012 for delivery in 2013, to provide the six expansion buses required for conventional service improvements proposed for 2013 and 2014.	Immediate fleet requirement to deliver the route and service enhancements in the Service Plan.	Not yet started	High
78	17.9.5.	That Peterborough Transit request additional capital funding in 2014, 2015 and 2016 to finance the acquisition of six expansion buses required for conventional service improvements in 2015, 2016 and 2017.	Future year capital budget planning requirement.	Not yet started	Medium
79	17.9.6.	That Peterborough Transit immediately replace the five low floor specialized transit fleet and the 1999 high floor van with more reliable high floor lift equipped Handi- Van vehicles.	Immediate requirement for continued delivery of Handi-Van services.	Not yet started	High
80	17.9.7.	That Peterborough Transit, if necessary, conduct a full business case analysis, with appropriate resources and budget, to identify all issues related to the	Decision on purchase of different size fleet should follow a Project to determine need.	Not yet started	Low

Item	Reference	Recommendation	Staff Comments	Status	Priority
		introduction of smaller buses to the Peterborough Transit fleet.			
81	17.9.8.	That Peterborough Transit review the adequacy of funding for the Maintenance Garage Equipment program.	Review for recommended inclusion in future capital budgets.	Not yet started	Low
82	17.9.9.	Working with an Accessible Advisory Committee, Peterborough Transit identify the physical conditions required for a stop or shelter location to be designated as fully accessible and establish the related capital budget to fund AODA compliance.	Work item started, will need Staff resources to complete and to carry out consultation.	Initiated	Medium
83	17.9.10.	That Peterborough Transit review the adequacy of funding for the acquisition of new and replacement shelters.	Review for recommended inclusion in future capital budgets.	Not yet started	Low
84	17.9.11.	That Peterborough Transit consider the development of a warrant system governing the location of new shelters.	Program delivery would be assisted by justification program.	Not yet started	Low
85	17.9.12	That the City of Peterborough develop a business case for a new Downtown Terminal and allocate required funding in the 10 Year Capital Program.	Project requires significant resources to review need and justification to develop business case.	Not yet started	Medium
86	17.9.13.	That the City of Peterborough undertake a site selection, preliminary design and costing study for a new downtown transit terminal (with consideration of multi-modal coordination and transit-supportive land uses at the site) and that federal and provincial funding support be sought for implementation.	Major Project with long term implications.	Not yet started	Medium
87	17.9.14.	That Peterborough Transit establish a capital budget for the acquisition of an	Transportation Division Transit and Traffic Section staff to work	initiated	Medium

Item	Reference	Recommendation	Staff Comments	Status	Priority
		upgraded GPS and for a Transit Signal Priority (TSP) program.	towards deployment of enhanced TSP system.		