



City of
Peterborough

TO: Members of the Committee of the Whole

FROM: Ken Doherty, Director of Community Services

MEETING DATE: September 7, 2010

SUBJECT: Report CSRS10-008
Relocation of the Lawn Bowling Clubhouse to Nicholls Oval

PURPOSE

A report to request direction from Council on the proposed sale of the Lawn Bowling Club Clubhouse to the Peterborough Rugby Club, and subsequent plan to relocate the facility to Nicholls Oval Park.

RECOMMENDATIONS

That Council approve the recommendations outlined in Report CSRS10-008 dated September 7, 2010, of the Director of Community Services, as follows:

- a) That the preferred option (Option 1) identified in this report be approved, specifically as follows:
 - i) That the sale of the Peterborough Lawn Bowling Club's Clubhouse facility to the Peterborough Rugby Club be considered an acceptable adaptive re-use of the facility;
 - ii) That costs totalling up to \$31,500 be charged to the Heritage Implementation Plan account for the relocation of the Clubhouse to Nicholls Oval if required;
 - iii) That staff include a 2011 Capital Budget Project in the Draft 2011 Capital Budget for the new Council's consideration to provide a grant and an

interest-bearing loan to the Peterborough Rugby Club, to assist with expenses in excess of their original capital reserve investment, their acquired Trillium Funding, and any funds issued by the City in 2010 to support this project for Council's consideration;

- iv) That the proposed relocation of the Clubhouse facility to Nicholls Oval Park, as per the site plan attached as "Appendix A" be approved;
- v) That City staff be directed to enter into a 50-year land lease agreement with the Peterborough Rugby Club to situate the Clubhouse in Nicholls Oval Park, and that a by-law be approved authorizing the Mayor and Clerk to sign the land lease agreement;
- vi) That for a period up to November 30, 2015, the City accepts donations, issues income tax receipts to donors, and deposits all monies received in an interest-bearing account held by the City in support of the Peterborough Rugby Club's fund-raising efforts.

(Or, if Council does not consider the Rugby Club proposal to relocate the Lawnbowling Clubhouse to Nicholl's Oval to be an acceptable adaptive re-use of the facility, then Council should approve Option 2 as outlined in b.)

- b) That the amendment passed at its meeting held June 14, 2010, remain in effect, specifically as follows:

That recommendation c) of Report CSD10-005, approved by City Council on January 18, 2010, be amended to read as follows:

- c) That, if a buyer with an acceptable adaptive re-use is not found, the City allow the Club to demolish the building at their expense, no sooner than March 1, 2011.

BUDGET AND FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The recommendations in this report require no new immediate 2010 budget requirements.

If the Preferred Recommendation (Option 1) is approved, the Draft 2011 Capital Budget will reflect a capital project for the new Council's consideration that would be financed from a long-term interest-bearing loan payable by the Rugby Club. The amount of the loan will equal the estimated \$590,000 for Phase 1 and 2 as set out in this report, less any direct funding from the Rugby's Club own capital reserve, their acquired Trillium Funding, if any, and the \$31,500 provided by the City in 2010. The loan would be

unsecured, and in the case of default, the City taxpayers would have to fund any balance owing.

If Council opts for Option 2, and no other uses are found prior to March 1, 2011, the Lawn Bowling Club will demolish the building and the City will have no further financial commitments or potential liability.

BACKGROUND

In June 2009, The Peterborough Lawn Bowling Club (PLBC) announced that it had received a Recreation Infrastructure Canada (RINC) Grant to build a new Clubhouse facility on their McDonnel Street site. This new building will make the existing Clubhouse redundant. The initial plan of the PLBC was to demolish the existing building. However, Council recognized the historical contribution the PLBC has made to Peterborough, of which the Clubhouse played a significant part.

While the City was not interested in obtaining ownership of the building, Council was interested in making efforts to preserve its heritage values. On January 11, 2010, Council amended the recommendations of staff report CSD10-005 as follows:

- a) *That staff be authorized to work with the Peterborough Lawn Bowling Club to seek an alternative use for the existing Peterborough Lawn Bowling Clubhouse at 581 McDonnel Street;*
- b) *That staff issue a Request for Proposal document to seek a buyer with an acceptable adaptive re-use for the Clubhouse that preserves the building's heritage values;*
- c) *That, if a buyer with an acceptable adaptive re-use is not found through the Request for Proposal document process, the City allow the Club to demolish the building at their expense;*
- d) *That a by-law be passed designating the proposed new Lawn Bowling Clubhouse at 577 McDonnel Street as a Municipal Capital Facility, pursuant to the Municipal Act.*

At its meeting held June 14, 2010, City Council approved the following motion regarding the Peterborough Lawn Bowling Club's existing Clubhouse:

That recommendation c) of Report CSD10-005, approved by City Council on January 18, 2010, be amended to read as follows:

- c) *That, if a buyer with an acceptable adaptive re-use is not found, the City allow the Club to demolish the building at their expense, no sooner than March 1, 2011.*

The Peterborough Lawn Bowling Club has established an agreement with the Peterborough Rugby Club for the sale and purchase of the Clubhouse. However, the sale is conditional on the Peterborough Rugby Club receiving City approval to relocate the Clubhouse to Nicholls Oval Park and securing appropriate financing to cover all relocation, renovation and servicing expenses.

Historical Significance of the Lawn Bowling Clubhouse

Organized lawn bowling in Peterborough dates to 1901 when a group established greens at the northeast corner of Simcoe and Aylmer Streets. In 1904, the Club relocated to the southwest corner of Brock and Aylmer, now the site of Fleming Park. In the fall of 1928, the Club bought the land for its current site on McDonnell Street from Mr. David Hatton. Six members obtained a charter from the provincial government and formed "The Peterborough Lawn Bowling Club, Ltd." which issued 2,500 shares to over 750 shareholders, raising \$25,000. The shareholders remain the owners of the land and building. The Club was officially opened in 1930 and has operated continually on the site since that date. It was the intention of the Club in 1930 to create "the finest bowling greens in Canada" according to its first president, J.H. Sedgewick. Today the Club considers the lawns and facility to be the finest in Ontario.

The Peterborough Lawn Bowling Club Clubhouse is a 1½ storey brick building built in the arts and crafts style. It features a large south facing veranda, which offers a panoramic view of the lawns allowing the building to interact with its surroundings and emphasizing its purpose. Also typical of the style are the building's recessed entrances, accessed by covered porches with pediments with battered wooden columns on brick piers. The proportions and gradual slope of the roof terminating in simple boxed soffits with classical modillions are common features of the Arts & Crafts movement. The multi-hued brick used is typical of the 1930s and can be seen on buildings from this time period throughout the City. The main floor of the interior of the Clubhouse contains original wooden features including built-in trophy cases, coffered ceilings, wainscoting, fireplace with dentil details and oak flooring with a geometric inlay.

Once the Clubhouse is moved to the new location, it will be possible to re-examine the facility to see if it meets the criteria for historical designation. City Council approved recommendations from staff not to designate the building in its current location at 581 McDonnell Street, allowing the Lawn Bowling Club to move forward with their new building. If a new use for the building is not found by March 31, 2011, the Lawn Bowling Club would then be able to demolish the building at their own expense, to prepare the site for their new Clubhouse.

If the proposed relocation project were approved, a long-term land lease agreement would be executed. The agreement will include a clause that the Rugby Club will

preserve the historical features of the Clubhouse and construction of any auxiliary buildings would be in the same architectural style.

Peterborough Rugby Club's Significance to the City

Rugby started in Peterborough during the late 1800's, at Nicholls Oval. The Peterborough Rugby Club is the second largest club in Ontario with 350 members, ranging in age from seven to 70+ years. This level of membership gives Peterborough the distinction of having the highest membership per capita, and the largest number of minor and junior players in the province.

The Club has a considerable representation of players and coaches on provincial teams, as well as players on Team Canada. With the Clubhouse in place, the Rugby Club is eligible to advance to the highest level of competition in the province, with the provision of change rooms and showers. The presence of the Clubhouse will provide sport tourism opportunities by hosting provincial and national level events.

The Peterborough Rugby Club has made significant contributions to capital improvements to Nicholls Oval within the past three years, which made it possible to install an irrigation system and new scoreboard within the park.

Relocating the Clubhouse to Nicholls Oval provides the City an opportunity to economically improve services to the park, preserve a building of historic significance, and generate sport tourism revenue for the community. The Rugby Club will be the primary user of the facility, but they will encourage use by other user groups and individuals.

Proposed Clubhouse Location In Nicholls Oval

The Peterborough Rugby Club has approached the Community Services Department to request approval to relocate the Clubhouse to Nicholls Oval. Attached, as "Appendix A", is a site plan illustrating the proposed location of the Clubhouse and necessary re-alignment of the paved track and parking area, as supported by City staff. "Appendix B" and "Appendix C" are photo-shopped images depicting the Clubhouse situated within Nicholls Oval Park. These images are being provided as a visual reference only.

The proposed location for relocation of the clubhouse is the third site considered within the Park. The first site considered was on the south side of the park towards the old splash pad. However, there was concern that this location provided poor visibility to the field and was isolated, creating issues related to security and vandalism. The second option considered was on the northeast corner of the park, by Parkhill Road and Armour Road. This location positioned the Clubhouse too close to neighbouring houses, interfered with the formal walkway entrance to the Park, and created a risk of removing more trees than the option being recommended.

Required Work Within Nicholls Oval Park

It is proposed that the Clubhouse would be moved from the Lawn Bowling Club in three pieces. It would be reassembled in Nicholls Oval on a full basement foundation, which will include four change rooms equipped with showers and washrooms. The services for sanitary sewer connection would be required to cross Parkhill Road with the sewer trench, as the sanitary service is located on the north side of the street.

The interior park road realignment would occur after the placing of the building and installation of the services. This would involve the removal of two or three trees. Every effort will be made to relocate the trees, rather than cutting them down. The placement of granular material, grading, and asphalt surfacing of the interior road and the construction of a small outbuilding could occur in a future phase of development.

There is a possibility of losing half a dozen parking spots due to the proposed location of the Clubhouse. However, the Rugby Club believes the remaining parking space would be sufficient to accommodate their activities, even with the intent of hosting higher caliber tournaments.

Project Phasing

The project could be completed in two phases to support fund-raising efforts. The first phase, predicated on approval of City support, would include:

- The acquisition of the Clubhouse
- Site preparation at Nicholls Oval
- Construction of basement footings and foundation to support the structure
- Construction of additional basement and roughed-in plumbing to support the expanded change room facility
- Site servicing

The second phase would proceed pending the availability of funds, including an application to the Trillium Foundation. This phase would include:

- Electrical upgrades
- Plumbing and outfitting of the change rooms and washrooms

The total estimated costs for Phase 1 & 2 are as follows:

Phase 1 Items	Estimated Cost
Building Relocation	\$55,000
Architectural/Engineering/Legal	\$5,348
Survey	\$2,000
Building Improvements	\$74,100
Security/Lighting	\$5,000
Servicing (electric)	\$11,210
Contingency	\$38,165
TOTAL	\$190,823

Note: Costs are net of In-kind contributions of \$19,375.

Phase 2 Items	Estimated Cost
Building Improvements	\$166,320
Servicing (Sanitary & Water)	\$71,000
Security/Lighting	\$4,520
Interior Road Relocation	\$45,000
Contingency	\$79,810
Landscaping	\$12,000
Outbuilding	\$20,400
TOTAL	\$399,050

Note: Costs are net of In-kind contributions of \$88,500.

Rugby Club's Request For Financial Assistance

The Peterborough Rugby Club has requested financial assistance from the City in the form of a grant and an interest-bearing loan, to cover expenses in excess of the \$60,000 they have already raised, and any funds they are able to acquire through a Trillium grant (Maximum \$150,000). The next two opportunities for Trillium applications are in November 2010 and March 2011. The Rugby Club is unable to obtain a mortgage, as they do not own the land on which the Clubhouse will be placed. The Rugby Club will be eligible to apply for Trillium Funding once they own the building and a land lease with the City is in place.

To encourage and support the Rugby Club's fund-raising efforts, staff recommends that for a period up to November 30, 2015, the City accepts donations, issues income tax receipts to donors, and deposits all monies received in an interest-bearing account held by the City.

Lease Agreement

With the current proposal, the Rugby Club would own the building but would also require a long-term lease with the City for the use of the land. Both are prerequisites for a Trillium application. Staff recommends a 50-year renewable lease agreement be signed between the City and the Rugby Club, and that the Mayor and Clerk be authorized to sign the agreement.

The agreement will require that every effort be made to preserve the heritage values of the Clubhouse during the relocation process. Ongoing repair and maintenance of the Clubhouse will be the responsibility of the Rugby Club. If, at any time, the Rugby Club ceases to exist, the Clubhouse will become the property of the City.

Neighbourhood Consultation

City Staff and the Peterborough Rugby Club invited neighbouring residents and organizers of major events that take place at Nicholls Oval Park to attend an information meeting on August 19, 2010 at 7:00 pm, at the Pavilion in Nicholls Oval Park. The site plan was presented along with a description of the type of activities that would be taking place at the Clubhouse. In addition to eight neighbourhood residents, the organizers of the Kawartha Dog show, the General Electric Picnic, and the Folk Festival were in attendance.

Attached as "Appendix D", is a summary of the responses to questions and concerns of those in attendance.

Recommended Options

Option 1

That the sale of the Peterborough Lawn Bowling Club's Clubhouse facility to the Peterborough Rugby Club be considered an acceptable adaptive re-use of the facility.

That staff be directed to allocate \$31,500 from the Heritage Implementation Plan account to support the costs of relocating the Clubhouse to Nicholls Oval.

That staff be directed to request in the 2011 budget a proposed funding allocation to provide a grant and an interest-bearing loan to the Peterborough Rugby Club, to assist with expenses in excess of their original capital reserve investment, their acquired Trillium Funding, and any funds issued by the City to support this project in 2010.

That the proposed relocation of the Clubhouse facility to Nicholls Oval Park, as per the site plan attached as "Appendix A" be approved, pending Council approval of the 2011 budget.

That City staff be directed to enter into a 50-year land lease agreement with the Peterborough Rugby Club to situate the Clubhouse in Nicholls Oval Park.

That for a period up to November 30, 2015, the City accepts donations, issues income tax receipts to donors, and deposits all monies received in an interest-bearing account held by the City.

Option 2

That the sale of the Peterborough Lawn Bowling Club's Clubhouse facility to the Peterborough Rugby Club not be considered an acceptable adaptive re-use of the facility.

That staff be authorized to continue working with the Peterborough Lawn Bowling Club to seek an alternative use for the existing Peterborough Lawn Bowling Clubhouse at 581 McDonnell Street.

That, if a buyer with an acceptable adaptive re-use is not found by March 1, 2011, the City allow the Lawn Bowling Club to demolish the building at their expense.

SUMMARY

Relocating the Lawn Bowling Clubhouse to Nicholls Oval Park creates opportunity to preserve a building of historic significance, provides amenities required to allow the Rugby Club to advance to the highest level of play both provincially and nationally, creates sport tourism opportunities, and improves the services to Nicholls Oval Park at a reduced rate for the City.

Submitted by,

Ken Doherty
Director of Community Services

Rob Anderson
Recreation Division Coordinator

Contact Name: Rob Anderson
Phone – (705) 742-7777 Ext. 1833
Fax – (705) 748-8824
E-Mail – randerson@peterborough.ca

Attachments:

Appendix A – Proposed Nicholls Oval Site Plan
Appendix B – Proposed Rear View of Clubhouse Re-Located in Nicholls Oval
Appendix C – Proposed Front View of Clubhouse Re-located in Nicholls Oval
Appendix D – Responses to Questions of the Neighbourhood Consultation