



City of
Peterborough

To: Members of the Committee of the Whole

From: Sandra Clancy, Director of Corporate Services

Meeting Date: July 25, 2016

Subject: Report CPFS16-024
Participatory Budgeting Pilot Vote Results

Purpose

A report to recommend the successful 2016 Participatory Budgeting Pilot projects be approved for implementation.

Recommendation

That Council approve the recommendation outlined in report CPFS16-024, dated July 25, 2016, of the Director of Corporate Services as follows:

That the following ten 2016 Participatory Budgeting (PB) projects be approved for implementation, as outlined in the following table:

Ward	Project Name	Cost
Ward 1 Otonabee	Crawford Trail Extension	\$16,020
	Pollinator Gardens	\$6,541
Ward 2 Monaghan	Kawartha Heights Park - Sandbox	\$3,560
	Hastings Park Improvements	\$8,000
	Roper Park Improvements	\$5,400
	Pollinating Gardens	\$3,000
Ward 3 Town	Protected Bike Lane Demonstration Project	\$9,500
	London Street Parkette Improvements	\$8,000
Ward 4 Ashburnham	Pollinator Gardens: Nicholls Oval and Rotary Trail	\$19,956
Ward 5 Northcrest	Pollinator Garden	\$18,820

Budget and Financial Implications

Each of the five wards was allocated \$20,000 for Participatory Budgeting through the 2016 Capital Budget (Project # 3-4.03) for a total of \$100,000.

The Participatory Budgeting Administration Budget of \$7,500 was established from the 2016 General Contingency Budget as approved in Report CPFS15-002 dated January 25, 2016, to fund items such as room rental and meeting facilitation. Of this budget, \$4,782 was spent administering the pilot, leaving a balance of \$2,718.

The total cost of the combined recommended projects is \$98,577. However, the Ward 1 - Otonabee vote resulted in a tie for the first place project. The total for both was estimated to cost \$22,561 which is more than the \$20,000 allotment for that ward. It is recommended that the overage of \$2,561 be funded with unspent funds that were allocated to cover administrative costs, leaving a surplus balance in the administration budget of \$157.

Of this total \$98,577 cost of the projects, \$96,016 will be funded through the capital project, leaving a balance of \$3,984 which may be used as a contingency for unforeseen items.

Background

During the 2015 budget process, Council expressed support for an increased level of public engagement in the budget process. Council approved Report CPFS15-019 Participatory Budgeting, dated May 11, 2015, which established the framework of the PB pilot program for the 2016 calendar year. Report CPFS15-002 dated January 25, 2016 recommended the launch of the My Peterborough Participatory Budget 2016 Pilot, establishing guidelines including goals, timelines, rules, roles and responsibilities.

The My Peterborough PB process was kicked off on February 17, 2016 with a public education session. In the following months, Councillors held ward specific community brainstorming meetings which were followed up by some informal community meetings. Project ideas were generated resulting in 52 registered projects.

Each Project Leader worked with City staff to learn about City plans and policies that could affect the project. Once the project detail was determined, a project cost estimate was developed. This combined information helped determine the project's eligibility. Ultimately 21 projects were considered eligible to advance to the vote. The full list of registered projects, by ward, and their eligibility status can be found in Appendix A - My Peterborough Participatory Budgeting 2016 Pilot - Registered Projects and Eligibility Status.

Project Leaders could start their campaign for votes on May 26, 2016, in advance of the voting period which ran between June 3 and June 15, 2016.

The Vote

All residents, age 16 and up, could vote for one project in their ward. Residents had a choice of voting on-line or at City Hall. The PB 2016 pilot relied on the honour system, and did not require community members to provide identification.

A community vote was not required in two wards. All four eligible projects in Monaghan Ward (Ward 2) were acclaimed, as the combined projects totaled \$19,960, falling within the \$20,000 ward budget. Northcrest Ward (Ward 5) had one eligible project valued at \$18,820. It was also acclaimed.

The remaining three wards participated in a vote.

The vast majority of residents engaged in the vote through the on-line system with 1,231 entering the on-line voting process. Of these, 1,098 completed the voting process, with 889 casting a ballot in one of the three wards that had a contest and 209 identifying with either Monaghan or Northcrest Wards, which had acclaimed projects. The remaining 133 individuals did not complete a ballot for a variety of reasons: they disqualified themselves because they were not eligible to vote (ex: residency or age) or perhaps they chose to complete the voting process at a later time, or not at all.

In addition, 12 ballots were cast in person at City Hall.

Results

Of the 21 projects eligible for vote, it is recommended that 10 projects advance to implementation.

In addition to the acclaimed projects in Monaghan and Northcrest Wards, staff are recommending that the top two projects in Town Ward (Ward 3) move forward to implementation. The Protected Bike Lane Demonstration Project had 111 votes and the London Street Parkette Improvements Project had 110 votes. Combined, these projects total \$17,500. In Ward 4 – Ashburnham, only the top project, Pollinator Gardens - Nichols Oval and Rotary Trail, with 99 votes, valued at \$19,956 is recommended to proceed.

The Ward 1 - Otonabee vote resulted in a tie for the first place project; Crawford Trail Extension and Pollinator Gardens each received 63 votes. The total cost for both is \$22,561. In the absence of pre-determined mechanism to handle a tie-vote scenario, staff recommend that both projects proceed and that the overage of \$2,561 be funded with unspent funds that were allocated to cover administrative costs of the PB Project.

Should Council approved the PB process again at some point in the future, lessons learned from this pilot will be incorporated into a revised framework and rules will be established beforehand on how to handle unforeseen circumstances such as tie vote scenarios.

The eligible projects, a brief description and vote results, together with the acclaimed projects are included in Appendix B - My Peterborough Participatory Budgeting 2016 Pilot - Vote Results and Successful Projects.

PB Evaluation and Future PB Processes

Evaluation of the pilot PB project is in progress and is expected to be reported out to Council in September 2016. The evaluation will measure the effectiveness of the pilot against the stated goals of the PB program, identify process improvements, quantify the amount of staff time to offer the program, and identify the impacts to the Corporation.

Summary

Of the 52 projects registered in the My Peterborough Participatory Budgeting 2016 Pilot, 10 are recommended to move forward to the implementation phase. It is anticipated that these projects will be completed within 12 to 18 months.

Submitted by,

Sandra Clancy
Director of Corporate Services

Contact Name:

Richard Freymond
Manager of Financial Services
Phone: 705-742-7777, Extension 1862
Toll Free: 1-855-738-3755
Fax: 705-876-4607
E-mail: rfreymond@peterborough.ca

Attachments:

Appendix A: My Peterborough Participatory Budgeting 2016 Pilot - Registered Projects and Eligibility Status

Appendix B: My Peterborough Participatory Budgeting 2016 Pilot – Vote Results and Successful Projects

Appendix A

My Peterborough Participatory Budgeting 2016 Pilot - Registered Projects and Eligibility Status

Ward 1 – Otonabee

Project Number	Project Name	Eligibility	Ineligibility reason
2016-W1-001	Improvements to the De La Fosse Library - Story Corner	Eligible	
2016-W1-002	De La Fosse Library - Curb appeal	Eligible	
2016-W1-003	Harper Park Signage	Eligible	
2016-W1-004	Crawford trail extension	Eligible	
2016-W1-005	Pollinator gardens	Eligible	
2016-W1-006	Cameron Street tot lot	Withdrawn	Withdrawn
2016-W1-007	Bowers Park Bandshell	Ineligible	Not Resident of Ward

Ward 2 – Monaghan

Project Number	Project Name	Eligibility	Ineligibility reason
2016-W2-001	Kawartha Heights Park - Sandbox	Eligible	
2016-W2-002	Tree Lot Sherbrooke Street West	Ineligible	Not city trails
2016-W2-003	Hastings Park Improvements	Eligible	
2016-W2-004	Improvements to Kawartha Park	Ineligible	Not city trails
2016-W2-005	Roper Park	Eligible	
2016-W2-006	Pollinating garden	Eligible	

Ward 3 – Town

Project Number	Project Name	Eligibility	Ineligibility reason
2016-W3-001	Decorative Downtown Lighting	Withdrawn	Doesn't have time to submit
2016-W3-002	Park Benches and Establishing Growth of New Trees	Declined	Trail not yet Developed
2016-W3-003	Community Orchards	Withdrawn	Merged with 2016-W3-007
2016-W3-004	Goose Pond/Otonabee River view enhancement	Eligible	
2016-W3-005	Pollinator pathways	Withdrawn	Merged with 2016-W3-007
2016-W3-006	Sherbrook Street Park upgrades	Withdrawn	Does not have time to submit
2016-W3-007	Pollinator Gardens	Withdrawn	Location not acceptable
2016-W3-008	Protected Bike Lane Demonstration Project	Eligible	
2016-W3-009	Birds & Bees on Bethune	Withdrawn	Merged with 2016-W3-007
2016-W3-0010	Sun shelter / Picnic shelter	Ineligible	Exceeds \$20,000 budget
2016-W3-0011	Hamilton Park Pavilion	Ineligible	Exceeds \$20,000 budget
2016-W3-0012	Safer Park St. Pedestrian Crossing	Ineligible	Traffic control
2016-W3-0013	Renovation of small park	Withdrawn	Final Submission not received
2016-W3-0014	Innovative Transit shelter	Withdrawn	Final Submission not received
2016-W3-0015	Artistic Bike Racks	Eligible	
2016-W3-0016	London Street Parkette Improvements	Eligible	
2016-W3-0017	Skate Park Lighting	Eligible	
2016-W3-0018	Community Rink Improvements	Withdrawn	Final Submission not received
2016-W3-0019	Highlighting Heritage on the Chemong Portage	Eligible	

Ward 4 – Ashburnham

Project Number	Project Name	Eligibility	Ineligibility reason
2016-W4-001	James Stevenson Park Improvements	Eligible	
2016-W4-002	Chelsea Gardens/Farmcrest Park Improvements	Eligible	
2016-W4-003	Waterfront Access Trail Beavermead Park South	Ineligible	Exceeds \$20,000 budget
2016-W4-004	Pollinator Garden - Seedling Trees	Withdrawn	Merged with 2016-W4-009
2016-W4-005	Expanded Riverside park	Eligible	
2016-W4-006	Walking route of Burnham Point	Eligible	
2016-W4-007	Access trail from Beavermead park south to Lansdowne St	Ineligible	Exceeds \$20,000 budget
2016-W4-008	Nichols Oval Restoration	Ineligible	Exceeds \$20,000 budget
2016-W4-009	Pollinator gardens for Nicholls oval and Rotary Trail	Eligible	
2016-W4-0010	Ashburnham Beautification	Withdrawn	Does not have time to submit
2016-W4-0011	Nicholls Oval Sugarbush	Ineligible	Received past deadline

Ward 5 – Northcrest

Project Number	Project Name	Eligibility	Ineligibility reason
2016-W5-001	3 Way Stop on Fairbairn at Raymond Street	Ineligible	Traffic control
2016-W5-002	Improve Pathway connecting 2 parts of Hillside Street	Ineligible	Beyond budget
2016-W5-003	Pollinator Gardens - Entrance to Parkway	Eligible	
2016-W5-004	Two park benches on Parkway Trail	Withdrawn	Withdrawn
2016-W5-005	Water Street North Trail	Ineligible	Exceeds \$20,000 budget
2016-W5-006	Enclosed bus shelter	Ineligible	Exceeds budget or not City land
2016-W5-007	Link the Trail for Pedestrians and Bikes across Parkhill Road	Ineligible	Traffic control
2016-W5-008	Rotary trail link safer intersections	Ineligible	Traffic control
2016-W5-009	Good stewardship of Jackson Park	Ineligible	Not a capital project

Appendix B

My Peterborough Participatory Budgeting 2016 Pilot - Vote Results and Successful Project

Project Name	Project Description	Cost	Votes	Recommended for Council Consideration
Ward 1 Otonabee				
Pollinator gardens	Pinewood Pollinator Garden - to build a pollinator-friendly garden, using native, perennial flowers, plants, shrubs and fruit trees that will provide continuous blooms throughout the seasons. The addition of a bench will encourage citizens to enjoy spending quality time around the garden.	\$6,541	63	Yes
Crawford trail extension	Crawford Trail Extension - Between Gillespie Ave. & McKellar Street; remove overgrowth, rail tracks, replace with beautiful pollinator garden along Erskine Ave., add decorative bench/s and waste/recycle containers. Add one street light on existing hydro pole at corner of McKellar St. Crawford Trail, behind Nurses. Create an accessible path/crossing from Crawford Trail to Lansdowne Place, back entrance, near Food Court.	\$16,020	63	Yes
Improvements to the De La Fosse Library - Story Corner	De La Fosse Story Corner: Creating a community living room. Improved lighting; new, comfy furniture; artwork; and an increased scope of children's activities, will improve the quality of the community's experience when they visit their neighbourhood branch library.	\$6,080	59	No
De La Fosse Library - Curb appeal	Discover De La Fosse - Your local Library. This branch Library building has a unique 1960s architectural style. This project will make the exterior more visible and attractive to vehicular traffic and pedestrians.	\$6,500	27	No
Harper Park Signage	Harper Park Signage - At present, there is no existing signage identifying the location of Harper Park and Harper Creek. Harper Park is home to the city's largest urban forest and includes a wide variety of undisturbed natural features. The signs would let the community be aware of its location and as such may allow them to appreciate its unique features.	\$2,500	24	No

Appendix B

My Peterborough Participatory Budgeting 2016 Pilot - Vote Results and Successful Project

Project Name	Project Description	Cost	Votes	Recommended for Council Consideration
Ward 2 Monaghan				
Kawartha Heights Park - Sandbox	Kawartha Heights Park playground sandbox with benches to separate sandbox users from park equipment users.	\$3,560	N/A	Yes
Hastings Park Improvements	Accessible picnic tables in Hastings Park	\$8,000	N/A	Yes
Roper Park	Planting of five trees close to Firwood Crescent. Provide park bench and locate near the new trees.	\$5,400	N/A	Yes
Pollinating garden	To make an attractive native plant garden to attract pollinating insects such as bees and butterflies, many of which are in serious decline	\$2,780	N/A	Yes
Ward 3 Town				
Protected Bike Lane Demonstration Project	This project will add physical separation between cyclists and cars on George St between London St and McDonnell St, through planters, curb or other means. The project would serve as a demonstration project to allow citizens to experience and reflect on the potential for physically separated bike lanes to help cyclists feel and stay safe while riding.	\$9,500	111	Yes
London Street Parkette Improvements	Planting of native trees surrounded by bird and pollinator friendly plants and shrubs. Placement of bench, community message board and waste bin. Creative planting to stop cars parking on lawn. This project is small but well located act of place making that restores place to pause, rest and gather in the shade on a well travelled pedestrian/bike route.	\$8,000	110	Yes
Skate Park Lighting	This proposal is intended to add four new lights for improved lighting at the skate board park. The advanced type of lighting will effectively illuminate the entire skatepark, reducing safety risks, injury and crime. The skatepark area will be a safer and more inviting public space. This will hopefully result in drawing a broader spectrum of people to explore the space & enjoy some of our vibrant youth community.	\$10,100	70	No

Appendix B

My Peterborough Participatory Budgeting 2016 Pilot - Vote Results and Successful Project

Project Name	Project Description	Cost	Votes	Recommended for Council Consideration
Ward 2 Town (continued)				
Goose Pond/Otonabee River view enhancement	On the east side of Water Street at Edinburgh Street along Otonabee River, trimming of trees and secondary growth (one-time) to improve sight lines out over the Otonabee River to provide views across the river to Inverlea Bridge and East City shoreline. Pedestrians, cyclists and vehicular traffic traveling along Water Street will once again be afforded the greatest view of the Otonabee River, second only to that of Little Lake.	\$5,200	29	No
Highlighting Heritage on the Chemong Portage	The Chemong Portage is an ancient pathway between the Otonabee River and Chemong Lake. Two larger signs and some smaller signs will be put up to provide information and mark the route. The project recognizes a combined Aboriginal and settler history, highlights and promotes our distinctive heritage, and engages residents and tourists alike to explore Peterborough/Nogojwanong.	\$10,060	26	No
Artistic Bike Racks	This proposal would include the design and construction of a mixture of three sets of artistic bike racks which are both functional and contribute to the beautification of the landscape surrounding the Del Crary Park/Little Lake. It will encourage community members to use alternative means of transit and the rack itself would add to the beautification of the area.	\$4,500	12	No

Appendix B

My Peterborough Participatory Budgeting 2016 Pilot - Vote Results and Successful Project

Project Name	Project Description	Cost	Votes	Recommended for Council Consideration
Ward 4 Ashburnham				
Pollinator gardens for Nicholls Oval and Rotary Trail	To build four 6-foot x 10-foot raised garden beds and one 12-foot diameter ground-level garden and then fill them with pollinator plants to increase the number and variety of pollinator species (bees, insects, etc.) in the local neighbourhoods and wild areas. The gardens will provide food in the form of nectar and pollen to increase the populations of pollinators local to those neighbourhoods, and these pollinators will in turn be available to pollinate home gardens and wild plants in the area. This is intended as an education project, so signs will be located at each garden. The signs will inform visitors about the value of pollinators to maintain our food and home gardens, and will provide information on how to start pollinator gardens at home. Contact information for local organizations will also be included: Peterborough Pollinators, Peterborough GreenUP, the Nourish Project, etc.	\$19,956	99	Yes
James Stevenson Park Improvements	Install four (4) 24' high square steel poles complete with four (4) 241W LED heads to illuminate the court. Each pole will be mounted on a concrete base. Power will be supplied from the nearby existing handwell to each pole with 50mm buried conduit. A timeclock and momentary push-button with timing relay for the lights will be installed as well. All disturbed landscaping during construction will be restored to existing conditions or better. Attached is an 8.5x14" detailed plan for your reference.	\$17,559	94	No

Appendix B

My Peterborough Participatory Budgeting 2016 Pilot - Vote Results and Successful Project

Project Name	Project Description	Cost	Votes	Recommended for Council Consideration
Ward 4 Ashburnham (continued)				
Chelsea Gardens/Farmcrest Park Improvements	Enhancements to Farmcrest park will include 2 Deco. Benches, 3 Armour Stones and 13 Oak Trees. Enhancements to Chelsea Gardens Park will include two 4-seat tables, 5 Armour Stones and 7 Oak Trees.	\$19,990	74	No
Expanded Riverside park	Remove the broken-down chain link fence in the area shown in the city aerial photograph, remove the debris in the park area that had been enclosed by the fence, and prune the current undergrowth where required. Complete the integrity of the outfield fence of the baseball diamond if and where required.	\$10,000	27	No
Walking route of Burnham Point	Trim this brush on the grassed area only west of Edgewater Blvd. and north of Bruce Street to a width of 10 feet, similar to a standard City walking path.	\$2,000	13	No
Ward 5 Northcrest				
Pollinator Gardens - Entrance to Parkway	This pollinator garden project aims to empower people in the community by providing an opportunity to better understand their natural habitats, to teach people how to build a pollinator garden, and to connect communities to environmental solutions that protect nature. The garden will be built alongside the Hilliard Community Garden. The project is building on existing infrastructure, and using the assets already available to the community. Moreover, the proposal includes new items that will add to the biodiversity of the area, including fruit trees and over 60 native, perennial, and drought-resistant plants. Once they blossom, they will provide essential food for pollinators also beautify the neighborhood with the addition of vibrant and colorful flowers.	\$18,820	N/A	Yes