



City of
Peterborough

To: Members of the Committee of the Whole

From: Malcolm Hunt, Director of Planning and Development Services

Meeting Date: April 18, 2016

Subject: Report PLPD16-031
Award of RFP P-03-16 The Conceptual Design of Charlotte Street and the Detailed Design of the Urban Park

Purpose

A report to recommend the award of Request for Proposals P-03-16 for a Prime Consultant for the Conceptual Design of Charlotte Street and the Detailed Design of the Urban Park.

Recommendation

That Council approve the recommendation outlined in Report PLPD16-031, dated April 18, 2016 of the Director of Planning and Development Services, as follows:

That RFP Document P-03-16 for a Prime Consultant for the Conceptual Design of Charlotte Street and the Detailed Design of the Urban Park Project be awarded to AECOM Canada Ltd., 300 Water Street, Whitby, Ontario L1N 9J2 at a cost of \$578,135 plus HST of \$75,158 for a total cost of \$653,293.

Budget and Financial Implications

The total net \$588,310 requirement, after applicable HST rebate, for the Conceptual Design of Charlotte Street and the Detailed Design of the Urban Park Project can be accommodated within the approved budget of \$5,290,000 in the 2016 capital project #7-1.07. After this contract is awarded, the remaining unallocated budget is \$4.46 million.

The estimated total cost for consulting services before the issuance of the RFP (net of HST and including all other taxes) was \$600,000.

All fee proposals include a \$30,000 allowance for a transportation analysis in the event the preferred conceptual design of Charlotte Street results in a significant change to the present vehicular function of the road. The fee proposals also include a \$50,000 contingency.

Background

Brief description of the work

The conceptual design of the Urban Park was approved by Council in 2014. Originally, the design and re-construction of Charlotte Street from Park Street to Water Street was included in the scope of work. However, the scope of the project was later revised to exclude the portion of Charlotte Street, from Park Street to the west side of Aylmer Street. The rationale for the change in scope relates to the Bethune Street project. Charlotte Street will be significantly impacted by the Bethune Street Project, as these streets intersect. The degree of the Bethune Street Project's impact on Charlotte Street infrastructure diminishes at Aylmer Street. As well, the section of Charlotte Street from the west side of Aylmer Street to Water Street could take on many of the characteristics of the Urban Park, including material choices and public space functions.

A map showing the area of the Urban Park and Charlotte Street Project is attached to this report as Exhibit "A". The scope of consulting services is divided into two parts. Part "A" includes the refinement of the Urban Park's conceptual design, its detailed design and the completion of the specification and tender package. Part "B" of the project includes the conceptual design of Charlotte Street, from the west side of Aylmer Street to Water Street as well as the east side of George Street, from Charlotte Street to Simcoe Street. Both activities are to be carried out simultaneously, with Charlotte Street's conceptual design and the Urban Park's tender package concluding early in the fall of this year.

More specifically, the scope of consulting services is as follows:

- a) A consultation process culminating in the conceptual design of Charlotte Street from the west side of the Aylmer Street intersection to Water Street;
- b) Conceptual design refinement of the Urban Park and the detailed design of a multi-purpose building within the Park.
- c) A transportation assessment, which may be necessary due to potential changes to the travelled portion of the road;
- d) The streetscape design of the east side of George Street, from Charlotte Street to Simcoe Street, not including the corner of the Simcoe Street – George Street intersection;
- e) The detailed design and the preparation of construction drawings and specifications for the Urban Park;

- f) The preparation of a Tender package for the Urban Park; and
- g) Construction Administration, Inspections and Supervision for the construction of the Urban Park.

RFP Issued

RFP P-03-16 was issued on January 28, 2016 and closed on February 18, 2016. The RFP was prepared by City Staff. Five submissions were received and are summarized in Chart 1. The Planner - Urban Design, the Financial Analyst - Special Projects, the Accessibility Compliance Coordinator, the Recreation Division Coordinator and the Utility Services Senior Project Manager reviewed the Proposals.

RFP Evaluation

This solicitation process was a Request for Proposals where a number of criteria were used to evaluate the submissions. The criteria and their relative weighting were clearly set out in the RFP document. Section 15 (3) (ix) of the City's Purchasing By-law 10-132 states that "as price is only one of the criteria evaluated, the award report will show the rating summary for each Proponent and the total points. The award report will disclose the price of the recommended supplier but not the price submitted by other Proponents".

RFP Evaluation Charts

Chart 1 below provides a summary of the RFP P-03-16 evaluation results.

Chart 1

Technical Evaluation

Component	Maximum Score	EDA	IBI	Brooks McIlroy	Dillon	AECOM
Project Understanding	25	13.0	13.4	19.6	22.6	20.2
Project Approach, Methodology and Work Plan	30	18.2	19.0	21.2	23.4	21.2
Schedule	15	12.4	12.8	10.4	13.2	13.4
Project Manager	20	11.0	14.8	16.8	15.6	15.4
Project Team	40	24.6	30.6	30.4	32.0	34.0
Similar Work Experience	30	22.6	25.8	25.8	25.0	24.8
Sub-total – Technical – minimum 120 points required to proceed to Financial Evaluation	160	101.8	116.4	124.2	131.8	129.0

As prescribed in the RFP, only proponents who achieved a benchmark score of 120 points on the Technical Evaluation had their fee proposal envelope opened.

Chart 2 Financial Evaluation

Component	Maximum Score	EDA	IBI	Brooks Mcllroy	Dillon	AECOM
Price Proponent with the lowest fee was given full percentage rating for this criterion. Next lowest and all others submitted were given a rating based on percentage difference to lowest cost using the following formula: $\frac{\text{cost of lowest proposal}}{\text{cost of proposal being evaluated}} \times 40$	40	–	–	26	33	40

Chart 3 Total Score

Component	Maximum Score	EDA	IBI	Brooks Mcllroy	Dillon	AECOM
Total – sum of Chart 1 and Chart 2	200	–	–	150.2	164.8	169.0
Rank	–	–	–	3	2	1

Recommended Prime Consultant

The Evaluation Committee recommends that the RFP be awarded to AECOM Canada Ltd. AECOM Canada Ltd scored the highest points in the evaluation process, which included an interview and reference checks. This firm met all the requirements of the RFP.

AECOM has a portfolio of similar projects, including the re-design of the Fulton Street Mall in Downtown Brooklyn New York, the water feature associated with the City of Guelph's Market Square, the Front Street Public Realm Reconfiguration in the City of Toronto and the re-design of the plaza and surrounding streetscape in the historic DUMBO neighbourhood in New York City. Acceptable references were also supplied.

AECOM's sub-consultants on the Project Team include the local Architectural firm: Lett Architects Inc., CIMCO Refrigeration and water feature specialists: DEW Inc., all of which have portfolios of similar projects.

AECOM is also the prime consultant for the Bethune Street Project. Their selection as the successful proponent for the conceptual design of Charlotte Street and the detailed design of the Urban Park will simplify coordination efforts with the Bethune Street Project.

Timelines

If the recommendation is approved, an agreement will be prepared for execution by the CAO and Clerk, under their delegated authority to do so before the work commences.

The Prime Consultant will commence the work soon after the agreement is signed following Council's approval of the recommendation. The conceptual design of Charlotte Street will come back to Council for approval in the last quarter of this year.

It is hoped that servicing work for the Urban Park can begin late this year, with construction concluding late in 2017.

Summary

RFP P-03-16 for a Prime Consultant for the Conceptual Design of Charlotte Street and the Detailed Design of the Urban Park has been issued in accordance with the City's Purchasing By-law 10-132 and can be awarded within approved budgets as recommended in this report.

Submitted by

Malcolm Hunt, Director,
Planning and Development
Services Department

Prepared by,

Brian Buchardt
Planner, Urban Design

Concurred with,

Ken Hetherington
Manager, Planning Division

Contact Name:

Brian Buchardt
Planner, Urban Design
Planning & Development Services
Phone: 705-742-7777 Ext 1734
Toll Free: 1-855-738-3755
Fax: 705-742-5218
E-mail: bbuchardt@peterborough.ca

Attachment:

Exhibit A: Project Area Map

Exhibit A: Project Area Map

