



City of  
**Peterborough**

---

**To:** **Members of the Committee of the Whole**

**From:** **W.H. Jackson, Director of Utility Services**

**Meeting Date:** **August 31, 2015**

**Subject:** **Report USPW15-012**  
**Update Report on Proposed Changes to Winter Services**

---

## **Purpose**

A report to update Council on proposed changes to winter services and how these changes relate to the recommendations contained in the Council approved Winter Services Report USPW14-002 dated August 4, 2014.

## **Recommendations**

That Council approve the recommendations outlined in Report USPW15-012 dated August 31, 2015, of the Director of Utility Services, as follows:

- a. That a 3-year pilot project to augment the existing Winter Control Services by the addition of 6 Temporary Winter Operators, the leasing of two articulated loaders and the hiring of additional contracted trucks as required be implemented; and
- b. That staff report back on the success of the pilot project after the 2017/2018 winter season.

## **Budget and Financial Implications**

Implementation of Alternative 3.4 as recommended in this report will cost an estimated \$305,000. City Council on August 4, 2014 authorized staff to include winter service upgrades that would cost \$505,000 when fully annualized in 2016. These funds have been included in the 2016 draft Operating Budget estimate and, accordingly, sufficient funds to implement Alternative 3.4 are included in the 2016 draft Operating Budget.

---

## Background

### Brief History

City Council at its meeting of February 4, 2014 requested staff to:

“Provide a report on the options to remove snow from bus stops and pay and display parking machines”.

At other various Council and Committee of the Whole meetings further concerns were expressed about winter services related to bus stops, sidewalks and local roads. The resulting report, USPW14-002 dated August 4, 2014 contained eight recommendations.

This report will update Council on the status of those recommendations.

### 1. Recommendations from Report USPW14-002

City Council, at its meeting of August 4, 2014, in discussing Report USPW14-002 approved the following:

- 1) That Council reaffirm the provision of road winter services based on the Minimum maintenance Standards issued under Ontario regulation 239/02 and as shown in Appendix F of Report USPW14-002;
- 2) That appropriate sand, salt and anti-icing material storage be included in the design of 791 Webber Ave. and in future capital budget estimates;
- 3) That the procurement and installation of individual anti-icing storage tanks on snow plow trucks and any other ancillary equipment be included in future capital budget estimates;
- 4) That a 2014 budget in the amount of \$55,000 funded from contingency be established for winter services during the 2014/2015 winter season at the properties listed in Appendix D, Section D.5 of Report USPW14-002 and that these locations be included in the tender to be issued for the provision of winter services at various parking lots throughout the City;
- 5) That \$70,000 be included in the 2015 draft Budget for Council consideration to contract snow removal and sand/salt application for all Transit stops and adult crossing guard locations in the City of Peterborough for the period November and December 2015 and that if approved in 2015, future budgets will include the full annualized costs of these services as shown in Table 1 of Report USPW14-002 (\$225,000);
- 6) That \$90,000 be included in the 2015 draft Budget for Council consideration to contract sidewalk snow clearing outside the area bounded by Television Road,

Monaghan Road, Lansdowne Street and Parkhill Road for the period November and December 2015 and that, if approved in 2015 future budgets include the full annualized costs of these services as shown in Table 1 of Report USPW14-002 (\$280,000)

- 7) That a Capital expenditure of \$230,000 be approved for the 2015/2016 winter season to add an additional combination plow/salt truck to the existing winter roads fleet; and
- 8) That By-Law Chapter 629 of the Peterborough Municipal Code be repealed and that staff be directed to develop a By-Law which will continue to require owners to remove or cause to be removed snow and ice from roof tops.

## **2. Update on Recommendations from Report USPW14-002**

Each of the eight recommendations has been incorporated into ongoing and upcoming activities except for the contracting of winter services (Recommendations 5 and 6).

With respect to Recommendations 5 and 6, Tender T-36-15 was released in the spring of 2015 to hire a contractor or contractors to provide winter control services for:

- approximately 2/3 of the City's sidewalk network;
- all transit stop stops; and
- all adult crossing guard locations.

Six contractors attended the mandatory orientation meeting but, at closing, only one tender was received.

The tender price received was more than the funding that was approved. Even after reducing the requirements of the tender, and with the proponent reducing the price significantly, it was obvious that the City was not going to be able to engage a contractor with the funds that are available to do the work that Council had authorized. Accordingly, the tender was cancelled due to insufficient budget for the scope of work requested.

Further to the above, Council at its meeting of August 4, 2015 in considering the minutes of the Budget Committee meeting of July 27, 2015, directed that the draft 2016 Operating Budget reflect an estimated 2.00% all-inclusive increase for increased operating costs and traditional support for the capital program. Council also directed staff to "... report back on service reductions proposed to be cut to reach the 2% all-inclusive tax increase."

In consideration of this, alternative winter service upgrades were reviewed.

### **3. Alternative Winter Services Upgrades**

Tender T-36-15 required that the successful contractor provide the field services to clear snow and ice on designated sidewalks, bus stops and adult crossing guard locations within a specified time period as well as provide dispatch and customer services. Although the efforts to secure a contractor to do this work failed at this time, it is imperative that alternatives be explored because of the need to improve our winter services. In consideration of this, a number of alternatives were considered as described below.

#### **3.1 Maintain Existing Winter Service Levels**

In this option, the existing winter service levels would be maintained with City staff and the additional funding (\$505,000) could be eliminated from the 2016 Operating Budget estimate.

#### **3.2 Reduce the Area of Contracting Services**

It is possible with the additional funding allocation to winter services to purchase contracted services to clear sidewalks, bus stops and adult crossing guard locations of snow and ice for approximately 25% of the initially proposed contractor area. However, this would result in two service levels within the City because of the extra labour and equipment being applied to the “contracted area”.

Implementation of this alternative would expend all of the additional funding.

#### **3.3 Re Tender**

There is always an option to re-tender. If this were to happen, the requirements and standards of the tender would have to be reduced significantly if the quotes are to come in within the allocated budget.

#### **3.4 Perform the Activities In-house**

Discussion has been had with CUPE Local 504 regarding the employment of seasonal workers during the winter months. Presently, this is prohibited in the Collective Agreement but there is a willingness to work together to see what can be done in this regard. If this is successful, Temporary Winter Operators would be added to the available labour pool to deal with winter storm events. Additionally, to ensure equipment is available to deal with the transit stops and adult crossing guard locations, loaders would be leased for the winter months and contracted trucks would be used when necessary. The specific proposal would include:

- Six Temporary winter operators;
- Two 4-wheel articulating loaders leased for four months each;
- Contracted trucks for an estimated 1000 hours; and

- The City's existing sidewalk tractors used for an additional 1000 hours in the winter because of the additional labour force.

The estimated total cost of this proposal is \$305,000. Accordingly, \$200,000 could be eliminated from the 2016 Operating Budget estimate.

Inasmuch as this is a hybrid service and the first time that Temporary winter operators will be used, it is proposed that this arrangement only be implemented as a pilot project for a three-year period.

## **Discussion**

Alternative 3.1 does not solve any of the winter service problems that have been stated in previous reports although it reduces the draft 2016 Operating budget the most.

Alternative 3.2 does provide an increased level of service for a specific portion of the City. However, it uses all of the additional winter service funds allocated by Council and leaves the majority (75%) of the City at the same level of winter service for sidewalks, transit stops and adult crossing guard locations that presently exists. Also, there is no reduction in the 2016 Operating budget.

Alternative 3.3 is possible but it may be difficult for contractors to put together labour and equipment packages this late in the year and have them available for the 2015/2016 winter season. Additionally, based on discussions with the bidder of Tender T-36-15, it is not obvious that acceptable bids would be received even if the tender requirements were substantially reduced.

Alternative 3.4 is a compromise not only between the level of service provided but also among the providers of winter service. Additional internal staff is proposed along with certain contracted services to improve the City's ability to deal with sidewalks, transit stops and adult crossing guard locations throughout the City. Alternative 3.4 also provides for a reduction of the 2016 Operating budget by \$200,000.

In consideration of the above, it is suggested that Alternative 3.4 be implemented as a pilot project for a three year period beginning in the 2015/2016 winter season.

## **4. Implications to the 2016 Draft Budget**

Implementation of Alternative 3.4 will cost an estimated \$305,000. Council, at its meeting of August 4, 2014 authorized an annualized increase in the 2016 Operating Budget of \$505,000 to account for increased winter services. The reduction in the draft 2016 Operating Budget related to winter services of \$200,000 will be identified as a proposed service reduction to assist in reaching a 2% all-inclusive tax increase.

## Summary

A tender to contract out various winter activities related to sidewalks, transit stops and adult crossing guard locations across the City was issued and ultimately withdrawn because of budget consideration. A number of alternatives have been discussed to deal with the desire to increase the level of winter service for these areas and an alternative that utilizes both increased in-house labour with contracted equipment is the preferred alternative.

Submitted by,

W. H. Jackson, P. Eng.  
Director Utility Services

Contact Name:  
Brian Jobbitt  
Public Works, Manager, Public Works  
Phone 705-745-1386  
Fax 705-743-3223  
E-mail address: [bjobbitt@peterborough.ca](mailto:bjobbitt@peterborough.ca)  
Toll Free: 1-855-738-3755